

**CITY OF CLEVELAND HEIGHTS
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES OF THE MEETING
AUGUST 21, 2018**

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Melissa Fliegel, Chair
Michael Wellman, Vice Chair
Greg Goss

STAFF PRESENT:

Brian Iorio, Planner

CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Iorio called the meeting to order at 7:05 PM at which time two members were present. Mr. Wellman arrived shortly after at 7:08 PM.

APPROVAL OF THE AUGUST 7, 2018 MINUTES

Members had no comments or questions so the minutes were approved as submitted.

**PUBLIC HEARING
AUGUST 21, 2018**

ABR 2018-404: Rory St. Jean, 3377 East Scarborough Road, requests to replace existing rear deck, building a larger 12' x 18' deck.

- Mr. St. Jean presented pictures to the ABR showing that their current 12' x 12' deck is in need of replacement. They would like to build a larger deck that extends an additional 6' on its east side. The style will remain the same.
- Mr. St. Jean added that there is an awning over the doorway in the rear of the home and that they intend to remove it and replace the lap siding behind it.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the deck as shown on the plans by the applicant, received July 24, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Goss, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2018-405: Ahmet Yavuz Eke, 3084 Essex Road, requests to build a detached, two-car garage.

- Mr. Eke stated that his current garage is original to the home and was built in the 1920's and is in need of replacement.
- Ms. Fliegel inquired about the materials he plans to use. Mr. Eke responded that the siding will be a blue/gray colored vinyl that will match the house.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman moved to approve the garage as shown on the plans by the applicant, received July 24, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Goss, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2018-406: Riben LLC, 3137 Fairmount Boulevard, requests to install a pair of front doors where three windows now exist.

- Myriam Ribenboim, Riben LLC, of 16800 Van Aken Blvd. #405, 44120 stated that their intention is to increase access to the yard by installing two French doors and two sidelights.
- Mr. Wellman asked what one would walk out onto when exiting through the proposed doors. Ms. Ribenboim responded that there is a berm and the yard slopes up toward the house.
- Ms. Fliegel asked if the applicant will be reusing the stone sill from the window for the threshold of the proposed doors. Ms. Ribenboim responded in the affirmative.

ACTION: Mr. Goss motioned to approve the plans prepared by the applicant, received July 30, 2018. Seconded by Ms. Fliegel, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2018-407: Brittany Lapin and Roger Hurley, 2769 Derbyshire Road, request to install larger first floor windows on back of house.

- Don Tarantino, 1802 Radner Rd, 44118, the project's designer, stated that several years ago, substantial renovations were completed at this property and a window replacement plan was formed. Here, they are removing a clear story set of windows and replacing it with a full height window that will match the other windows on the home. They will reuse the stone sill from the current window.
- Mr. Wellman noted that there are currently several window styles on the home.
- Ms. Fliegel asked what room this project would affect and if there are other windows in that room. Mr. Tarantino responded that it is the living room and that there are other windows in the room on the other side of the home.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman motioned to approve the window replacement as shown on the plans prepared by Donald J. Tarantino, received July 31, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Goss, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2018-408: Don and Jane Kimmel, 2295 North St. James Parkway, request to build a detached, two-car garage.

- Duane Schreiner of Shannonwood Homes, 1635 Wood Rd., 44121, stated that they will be using a light-gray colored siding to match the home. They will also be using a charcoal colored asphalt shingle.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel motioned to approve the garage as shown in the plans prepared by Shannonwood Homes LLC, received July 31, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2018-409: Eric Baud, 2248 Coventry Road, requests to replace 6' wooden fence using fence of same height having different style.

- Michael Beightol of Exscape Designs, PO Box 139, Novelty, Ohio, 44072 is asking to replace an existing 6' stockade fence along Clarkson Road with a 6' California-style vertical privacy fence.
- Mr. Beightol stated that the fence is currently at a diagonal from Clarkson Rd. to Coventry Rd. The replacement fence will be positioned at a right angle to capture more of the property within the fence. The existing ground ivy will be replaced with grass.
- Ms. Fliegel noted that this project will be a nice improvement.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel motioned to approve the fence as shown on the plans prepared by Exscape Designs, received August 1, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2018-410: Sanford Beckerman, 1383 Edendale Street, requests to install vinyl siding without matching the home's siding size.

- Sanford Beckerman of 1383 Edendale Street, 44121 stated that he has lived in the home for 47 years and that it is time to replace the siding.
- Ms. Fliegel inquired about the existing window trim and whether the detail will remain. Mr. Beckerman responded that he will do whatever ABR requests.
- Mr. Wellman asked if the brick on the house will be covered. Mr. Beckerman responded no.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel motioned to approve the application prepared by Sanford Beckerman, received August 1, 2018, on the condition that the existing window trim detail is maintained. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2018-411: Valon Jusufi and Zana Hocha, 2549 Edgehill Road, request to build new rear stair on back of house.

- Valon Jusufi and Zana Hocha, 2549 Edgehill Rd., 44106 stated that they have two small children and spend a majority of time during the day on the third floor of the home. She has become anxious about the possibility of a house fire and would like to construct emergency stairs at the rear of the home. They would also install doors to access the stairs.
- Mr. Jusufi stated that they may have to cut into the roof in order to install a door on the third floor.
- Ms. Fliegel asked if the flat roof would need to be extended. Mr. Jusufi replied in the affirmative.

- Mr. Goss noted that there are two options in the application, a circular stair and wooden stairs. Mr. Jusufi stated that after consulting with Richard Wong, it was determined that the circular stair is not recommended due to ice and snow in the winter.
- Ms. Fliegel expressed her difficulty accepting this project. While she understands the concern of the applicants, the large mass of the staircase on the outside of the house is not ideal. Ms. Fliegel pointed out that this is an elective project and not a requirement of the fire code. She requested finished elevations from all three sides to better understand what the staircase will look like. She also would like to better understand what it would look like to lower the sill and install a door on the third floor.
- Mr. Wellman noted that some of these details, like the foundations, would be required by the Building Department for a permit. He is also interested in better understanding how the roofs will interact.
- Mr. Jusufi said that there is a third option to peak the roof in the rear like the front of the house to accommodate the door. He also stated that he can develop more details and return with more options.
- Mr. Wellman stated that he would be willing to continue the case if the applicant can return with a better plan to integrate the staircase into the house and provide more details such as the style of railing. Mr. Jusufi said he intends to mimic the railings from the deck.
- Ms. Fliegel requested a comprehensive roof plan in order to understand what the roof will look like.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman moved to continue the case. Seconded by Ms. Fliegel, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2018-413: Nicole Shefrin, 3594 Runnymede Boulevard, requests to build a rear deck.

- Gideon Zakich of the Woodland Deck Co., 5260 Wooster Rd. W., Norton, Ohio, 44203 presented a request to build a 38' x 16' rear deck, 16" above grade, with one 8' step. He also brought with him a 3-D rendering of the proposed deck.
- Ms. Fliegel asked what materials were to be used. Mr. Zakich responded that the plans are wrong and that they were going to be using wood and not Trex.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman motioned to approve the deck, noting on the plans prepared by Woodland Deck Company, received August 15, 2018, that it is a wood deck and not a Trex deck. Seconded by Mr. Goss, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2018-414: Michael Bier, 2333 Grandview Road, requests to replace kitchen windows without matching existing windows' appearance.

- Michael Bier, 2333 Grandview Rd., 44106 presented his request to reposition and enlarge windows in his kitchen to increase the amount of daylight the room receives.
- Ms. Fliegel asked if the kitchen is being remodeled. Mr. Bier said no it was remodeled several years ago.
- Ms. Fliegel asked if the exhaust fan was being moved. Mr. Bier responded no.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman motioned to approve the project as shown on the plans prepared by The Beard Group, Ltd., received August 7, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Goss, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2018-415: Diana Gurley, 2160 Delaware Drive, requests to build a detached, two-car garage.

- Tim Akhadov of Platinum Construction, 5081 Warrensville Center Rd, 44137 presented his request to construct a 20' x 20' garage. The asphalt shingle and siding will match the house.
- Ms. Fliegel and Mr. Wellman suggested that they match the siding on the garage to the cream trim color on the house rather than the bright blue.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman motioned to approve the plans prepared by Platinum Construction, received August 7, 2018, on the condition that the color of the siding match the cream trim on the house. Seconded by Ms. Fliegel, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2018-416: Jerry Eboh, 982 Montford Road, requests to build a detached, two-car garage.

- Marta Fortos of New Creation Builders, 818 E. 73rd St., 44103 is requesting approval for a 20' x 20' detached garage.
- Ms. Fliegel asked if the siding will be vinyl. Ms. Fortos was unsure, however the material sample she brought indicated vinyl.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel motioned to approve the garage as shown on the plans prepared by New Creation Builders, received August 7, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Goss, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2018-417: Dianna Woods, 1019 Quilliams Road, requests to build a detached, two-car garage.

- Dianna Woods, 1019 Quilliams Rd., 44121 stated that the garage and pad of her current garage has become deteriorated. She is requesting to replace it with a 24' x 20' replacement garage.
- Ms. Fliegel inquired about the color of the siding. Ms. Woods stated that it would match the color of the current garage.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman motioned to approve the garage as shown on the plans prepared by Sexton & Associates, Inc., received August 6, 2018. Seconded by Ms. Fliegel, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2018-418: Shari Nacson and Ben Nichols, 3347 Bradford Road, request alterations including window replacements and entry roofs.

- Shari Nacson, 3347 Bradford Rd., 44118, presented her request to replace the windows with wood-clad sash windows and to replace the front door with a mission-style door with sidelights on the front façade. They will install storm windows on the second floor's front façade and in the kitchen. They will also rebuild the front stoop, reducing its intrusion past the building line and complementing the remodeled column-less front portico. The concrete walk will be replaced with sandstone. The wing walls will be brick with sandstone caps. The stucco is being replaced with cedar shake and the window trim will be replaced to match the rest of the home. The last improvement will be to add overhangs along the front and over the side door.
- Ms. Fliegel questioned the depth of the front porch overhang. She expressed that the porch feels "heavy" at its current depth. She requested that the applicant revise the plans to remove at least one foot. Mr. Wellman agreed.
- Ms. Fliegel commented that this revision could be reviewed administratively by Mr. Wong with email consultation by the members of the Board.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel motioned to approve the renovations shown on the plans prepared by Harmoni Designs, received August 7, 2018, on the condition that the revisions on page A4-2 of the plans are revised to reflect a reduced depth to the front porch overhang. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2018-419: DIESHA WITHERSTOON, 2204 NOBLE ROAD, requests to install Jewellz Fine Dining sign.

- Aido Dure of Bnext Design, 5109 Clark Ave., 44102, presented his request to install a sign at 2204 Noble Road. The sign is smaller than the current sign at this location.
- Ms. Fliegel stated that the newly exposed façade needs to be repaired so that you cannot tell that the previous sign was larger. Mr. Dure responded that they plan on repairing the façade.
- Mr. Dure clarified that the letters on the sign are channel letters and will be three dimensional with a white background. The subtext will be a small cabinet sign.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman motioned to approve the sign as shown on the plans prepared by Bnext Design, received August 7, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Goss, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2018-420: Richard Willis, 3591 Northvale Road, requests to replace tile roof using asphalt shingles.

- Mr. Iorio noted that there is correspondence from the homeowners association that has been distributed to the members of the ABR. The HOA requested that the ABR not approve anything until the HOA approves the project. Mr. Iorio clarified for the ABR that they are under no obligation to enforce a third-party's requirements.
- Frank Mitchell of Frank Mitchell Carpentry, LLC., 19413 Holiday Lane, Warrensville Heights, 44122, presented the application on behalf of Richard Willis, a disabled veteran. Mr. Mitchell stated that Mr. Willis has repaired his current tile roof many times. Mr. Willis cannot afford to replace the tile roof with another tile roof and is requesting to replace the tile with asphalt shingles. They will also install ridge vents.
- Mr. Mitchell also noted that there are several homes in the neighborhood with asphalt shingles. One of Mr. Willis' neighbors appeared and verified that he has asphalt shingles as his roof material.
- Mr. Iorio asked that Mr. Mitchell notify Mr. Willis that he may be eligible for rehab assistance through the City or the Home Repair Resource Center.
- Ms. Fliegel stated that she does struggle, in general, with the replacement of tile roofs with asphalt, however, she does not feel that this project is detrimental to the value of this particular home or the adjoining homes. She stated that each home in this neighborhood should be evaluated on an individual basis and in this particular home, the details are fairly simplistic and she doesn't necessarily feel that the tile roof is a defining characteristic. Additionally, the home is in disrepair and in need of repair.
- Mr. Goss noted that this home has a lot of roof and therefore it's important that the shingle used is architectural-grade.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel motioned to approve the roof as shown in the application prepared by Frank Mitchell Carpentry, LLC, received August 6, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2018-421: Carlos and Marta Maragano, 3155 Euclid Heights Boulevard, requests to increase the size of living room windows.

- Marta Maragano, 3155 Euclid Heights Blvd., 44118, stated that they would like to match the windows on Euclid Heights Blvd. to the windows on the Cumberland Rd. side of the house in order to increase the amount of natural light in the home. The home is a duplex and eventually they would like the windows on the opposite side of the home to match.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman motioned to approve the windows as shown in the plans prepared by the applicant, received August 6, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Goss, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2018-422: Alexei Kaminski, 3410 Blanche Avenue, requests to build two-story rear addition.

- Alexei Kaminski, 3410 Blanche Ave., 44118, presented his request build a rear addition to his home.
- Ms. Fliegel expressed concern regarding the overhang over the rear entry. Mr. Kaminski responded that they would like more space on the second floor and to provide shelter outside of the rear entry.
- Ms. Fliegel also expressed concern over how close the metal roof comes to the sill of the dormer window. She asked for better detail showing the distance from the sill to the edge of the addition's roof. She requested that the distance should be at least 8" apart and the slope of the roof could be reduced.
- Mr. Wellman asked about the siding material proposed. Mr. Kaminski said that it will be vinyl siding.
- Mr. Goss expressed concern about the corners of the existing home being flush with the corners of the addition where there are different siding types. He requested that the addition should be inset from the original home.
- Mr. Wellman suggested that a pergola could be added to the overhang that could help the addition better integrate with the original home.
- Ms. Fliegel stated that the plans can be conditionally approved however a permit should not be issued until an administrative approval is attained concerning the three outstanding issues.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman motioned to approve the addition on the plans prepared by Rebecca Fertel, Architect, received August 6, 2018, on the condition that: detail is shown that the addition's roof is no less than 8" from the bottom of the sill of the dormer window; detail is shown that the addition is inset where it meets the original home so that they are not on the same plane; and that a pergola, or something similar, is added to the plans so that the overhang over the rear entry is better integrated into the original house. Seconded by Ms. Fliegel, the motion passed unanimously.

Old Business

No old business was raised.

New Business

No new business was raised.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 9:38 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,

Melissa Fliegel, Chair

date

Richard Wong, Secretary

date