

**PLANNING COMMISSION**  
**March 9, 2016**  
**MEETING MINUTES**

MEMBERS PRESENT:	Craig Cobb Adam Howe Len Horowitz Anthony Mattox, Jr.  Jessica Cohen	Vice Chair
MEMBERS ABSENT:	Michael Ungar Jeff Rink	Chair
STAFF PRESENT:	Richard Wong  Kara Hamley O'Donnell Elizabeth Rothenberg  Mary Dunbar	Director of Planning & Development City Planner Assistant Director of Law  City Council Planning & Development Committee Chair

Mr. Cobb began with saying good evening and welcome to the March 9, 2016, meeting of the Cleveland Heights Planning Commission. He stated that our first order of business this evening is to have the roll call. Mr. Wong called the roll:

Mr. Cobb	Present
Ms. Cohen	Here
Mr. Horowitz	Here
Mr. Howe	Here
Mr. Mattox	Here

Mr. Wong stated five present.

Ms. Rothenberg began with saying she would like to introduce everyone to her colleague, Tiffany Hill, sitting here next to Council Member Mary Dunbar. Ms. Hill is here training today.

Mr. Cobb asked if everyone has had a chance to look at last month's minutes and he asked if there were any changes or corrections. There were none and they have been approved.

Mr. Cobb welcomed everyone again, and stated that the meeting is being recorded tonight so it is important that if you are going to speak, after you are recognized, if you could come to the lectern and if you would give us your name and address. He stated also, if you are planning on testifying this evening, you will have to take an oath or affirmation.

Ms. Rothenberg stood and swore in all that stood for Project 16-10. Mr. Wong and Ms. Hamley O'Donnell and all who planned to testify were sworn in.

**Project 16-10: Northern Ohio Recovery Assoc.**, potential tenant, former rectory at **Imani Bible Fellowship, 2463 N. Taylor**, 'A' single-family, requests Conditional Use Permit for 30-bed extended care/residential treatment facility per Code section 1111, 1115, 1121, 1151, 1153, 1161, 1165 and 1166.

Mr. Cobb added as a reminder, if you do get up to speak he stated he will ask you to affirm that you did take the affirmation so it appears on our record. Mr. Cobb stated that first we will hear from staff, then from the applicant and then anyone from the community that would like an opportunity to speak to us will have that opportunity.

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell began with stating that this property is the former rectory that is part of the Imani Temple Ministry Campus. She stated there is a school and a church building, a parking lot and a play area. She stated, as you know, this is the former location of St. Louis Catholic Church and school. Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated that just to the south is Council Gardens, which is a seven-acre senior living apartment complex which is zoned multi-family 1 and then to the north and to the east are single family housing in an A-single family district. She also pointed out single-family houses on North Taylor Road. She stated the structure we are talking about is on the south side of this 5.2 acre property and is separated from the school by a two-lane driveway and a grass area.

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated that North Taylor Road, as you can see, is five lanes wide and provides a natural buffer. She said the site's location is more than 100 feet from nearby Council Garden Apartments and more than 150 feet from the properties across the street on South Taylor. She added this is more than 200 feet from the closest property on Glen Allen Drive. Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated that the existing building was built in 1962 and this site was the former rectory for the priests. The rectory has been vacant since the date the Imani Temple Ministries purchased the site and maybe even was vacated by the priests a few years prior to the sale of the property. Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated the rectory has multiple sleeping and sitting areas. She showed a close up slide of this. She also showed slides of the outside. Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated on the first floor there is a kitchen and a dining room parlor along with several offices. She stated there are several suites and sleeping areas on the second floor and in the area above the garage, there are multiple bedrooms and sitting rooms. She stated in the basement there are larger sitting areas.

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated that the Planning Commission has issued several Conditional Use Permits for the church and school buildings and last year the Board of Zoning Appeals granted a Use Variance for this former rectory to be a Conditionally permitted lodging house. She stated the Use Variance stated that the operating of any lodging house in the former rectory must obtain a Conditional Use Permit. Also last year, the Planning Commission approved a 25-resident lodging house for Veterans Transitional Housing Services with multiple conditions placed upon them, which are in your staff report. She said the Veterans Transitional Housing Services never occupied the building. The property owners then moved forward trying to find new tenants for this space. She stated that the Northern Ohio Recovery Association proposes a 30-person extended-care residential facility for woman and their children. She stated the average distribution of residents will be 20 adults and 10 children. She stated the residents will be receiving counseling, employment readiness and other services described in the application materials. She stated there will be an employee on site, 24-hours a day, with an anticipated staff of three clinical treatment positions, two case managers, one cook and one housekeeper, one maintenance person and one administrator. Ms. Hamley O'Donnell said the typical resident will stay 3-6 months, and the residents will not be permitted to have their own transportation on site and staff will require no more than 15 parking spaces. She stated, for extended care nursing home uses, our Code requires 1 space per 3 beds which equals 10 spaces, in this case. She stated the applicants will use the existing parking in the 145-space parking lot nearby and to the north of the site. She stated that this use falls into the Zoning Code definition of nursing homes.

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated that she received some calls this afternoon from neighbors because next week the Board of Zoning Appeals will hear a Use Variance request for a nursing home use on this site. She stated there were some questions from neighbors about these two different hearings and what they were. She explained that next week the Board of Zoning Appeals will hear whether they can get the Use Variance for the nursing home classification. She stated they found that this use falls under the nursing home classification which is defined as "an extended or intermediate care facility which provides services for the rehabilitation of persons who are convalescing from illness or incapacitation." She stated again that the building has already had Use Variances for a lodging house. She stated it is next Wednesday they will hear the case for this Use Variance. Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated the Conditional Use Permit would be issued to NORA which is who would be the tenant of this space. She added that, if in the future, a different tenant planned to use the building for a lodging house or extended and intermediate care facility or nursing home, a new Conditional Use Permit would be required so this is specifically for this applicant. She stated we review all of these based on the Standards for Conditional Uses which are on the screen in front of you.

*(a) That the conditional use will be in general accord with the purpose, intent and basic planning objectives of this Zoning Code, and with the objectives for the district in which located;*

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated that one purpose of the Zoning Code is to describe that it is to encourage as a Conditional Use flexible residential development to promote creative and efficient use of land through unified development. She stated that Section (F), further states that the purpose of the residential zoning code is to encourage sustainable development and practices in residential neighborhoods. Ms. Hamley O'Donnell went on to explain that the building's existing floor plan is not suitable for a single-family dwelling; the only permitted use in the 'A' Single-Family District. The proposed use is residential in nature and will work well within the design of the building with its multiple separate private areas.

*(b) That the establishment, maintenance or operation of the conditional use will not be detrimental to or endanger the public health, safety, morals, comfort or general welfare;*

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated that the essential character of the neighborhood would not be substantially altered. She stated this property has never been used as a single-family house, and its proposed use for congregate living is not unlike its use as a rectory. She stated that none of the adjoining properties should suffer any detriment as a result of this use, which is a substantial distance away from other residential properties. She stated that adjacent structures include Council Gardens, a multiple-family complex to the south and single-family homes. She stated the site operated as a rectory for many years with no adverse effect on the public health, safety or general welfare and we do not see that the use will pose an adverse effect.

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated that the applicant said it will be inhabited by staff members, 24 hours a day, 7 days a week. She said that residents are not permitted to have their own vehicles. She stated that the applicant should assure the commission that the residents, staff and deliveries will not produce noise or other disruptions that may negatively impact neighboring residents.

*(c) That the conditional use will be designed, constructed, operated and maintained so as to be harmonious and appropriate in appearance with the existing or intended character of the general vicinity, and that such use will not essentially change the character of the same area;*

She stated there are no exterior changes planned for the building and this should not change the character of the neighborhood.

*(d) That the conditional use will not be injurious to the use and enjoyment of other property in the immediate vicinity for the purposes already permitted, nor substantially diminish and impair property values within the neighborhood;*

As we stated before, the site's location is more than 100 feet from Council Gardens and more than 150-200 feet from a nearby residence in the single-family district. Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated that the use will complement the residential nature of the neighborhood and will not create additional noise or other negative impact on the neighbors. She stated the applicant should show the neighbors and the Commission that this use will not negatively impact the neighbors by excessive noise, deliveries, traffic and other activity.

*(e) That the establishment of the conditional use will not impede the normal and orderly development and improvement of the surrounding property for uses permitted in the district;*

We feel that the re-use of the building shall not impact future development or improvement in the neighborhood.

*(f) That adequate utilities, access roads, drainage and/or necessary facilities have been or are being provided;*

The existing infrastructure should not be impacted by the proposed use.

*(g) That adequate measures have been or will be taken to provide ingress and egress designed as to minimize traffic congestion in the public streets;*

No changes to traffic flow are proposed, the residents will not be permitted to have vehicles and we do not anticipate any congestion from the proposed use.

*(h) That the establishment of the conditional use should not be detrimental to the economic welfare of the community by creating excessive additional requirements at public cost for public facilities such as police, fire and schools;*

The applicant should assure the Commission that the proposed use will not create excessive additional requirements for Fire, Police and EMS. The public's economic welfare will benefit from the creation of new jobs and the increased income taxes.

*(i) That there is minimal potential for future hardship on the conditional use that could result from the proposed use being surrounded by uses permitted by right that are incompatible;*

We do not see any future hardship.

*(j) That the conditional use shall address the sustainability guidelines of Section 1165.06.*

We will address under Sustainability.

*(k) That the conditional use shall, in all other respects, conform to the applicable regulations of the district in which it is located as well as the specific supplemental conditions set forth in Chapter 1153.*

Not applicable.

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated they do meet the parking standards and most of our Sustainability Guidelines are not specifically pertinent to this use, however, the Sustainability Guidelines do encourage historic preservation and adaptive reuse of existing structures. She stated that encouraging reuse of a vacant building is important to Cleveland Heights sustainability and the social sustainability is addressed by providing shelter to those in need.

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated that staff recommends the Planning Commission approve an extended care residential facility with up to 30 residents operated by Northern Ohio Recovery Association with the following additional conditions:

1. *This approval is conditioned upon the granting of an amendment to the existing Use Variance for the site's use to include nursing homes (defined as an extended or intermediate care facility by the Zoning Code) by the Board of Zoning Appeals and City Council;*

2. *This use shall not be injurious to the use and enjoyment of other properties in the immediate vicinity or create a nuisance for adjacent properties;*
3. *The applicants shall work with staff to resolve any complaints from neighbors;*
4. *Any Housing, Building or Fire Code violations shall be corrected prior to occupancy;*
5. *Existing landscaping shall be maintained or, if desired, a new landscape plan shall be approved by the Planning Director;*
6. *If new exterior lighting is proposed, applicant shall submit lighting plan for Planning Director approval;*
7. *Any expansion of the use shall require a new Conditional Use Permit;*
8. *Deliveries and trash pick-up shall not take place before 7 a.m. or after 9 p.m.;*
9. *Applicant shall maintain 1 parking space per 3 beds per Code section 1161.03(a)(8); and*
10. *Any required construction and installation of the use shall be completed within 18 months of Planning Commission approval.*

Mr. Cobb thanked Ms. O'Donnell and asked if anyone has questions for staff.

A woman came to the lectern and stated her name is Anita Bradley, and that she is the Executive Director of the Northern Ohio Recovery Association (NORA). She said her address is 20433 Prairie Meadows Place, Strongsville, OH 44149 and she stated she did take the oath.

She began with stating that they have been in business since 2004. Ms. Bradley said she has been in the profession for over 24 years and in recovery for 25 years. She stated she grew up in Cleveland Heights, prior to going to college and she stated they see the need to develop an organization based on problems that some of the woman were having with substance abuse. Ms. Bradley stated they desired to have a treatment program. She said they currently have a program that is operating on the campus of where St. Cathedral, Church of God and Christ, is located in the Shaker area. She stated on that campus is exactly what we have here. There was the school, Hope Academy, the church and also Benedictine High School. She stated they have been there since 2007 with several different locations. Ms. Bradley said at this particular location, we desired to move and expand our capacity and also to an area that is a little more conducive to the woman that we serve. She said she has a staff of 64 people. Ms. Bradley stated at this facility there are about 12 people. She stated the clinical team comes in between 9:00 and 5:00 PM. She said at 5 PM, there are 2 other people that come in to monitor the facility and then on the 3<sup>rd</sup> shift there are 2 people as well. Ms. Bradley stated they have coverage on the weekends. She stated her desire is to move the location. Ms. Bradley stated she has worked very well with the landlord that they have right now; they just desire to have a location more conducive to their environment. She stated it would be good for her to be able to come back to where she lived for 25 years and have these woman come and become productive citizens of society. Ms. Bradley stated she is in charge of the day to day operations and then we will have our Clinical Director speak briefly and answer any questions you have.

Mr. Cobb thanked Ms. Bradley.

A woman came to the lectern and stated her name is Billie Gilliam, 956 Roanoke Road, Cleveland Hts. OH 44121. She also wanted to say she is a resident of Cleveland Heights, she grew up in Cleveland Heights and her mother still lives in Cleveland Heights as well. Ms. Gilliam said she wanted to speak to some of the concerns this evening. Ms. Gilliam did read the letter of concern sent [on behalf of Council Gardens] and she stated she feels very

connected with them after reading about some of the issues and fears that are associated with that. Ms. Gilliam wanted to say she felt they were more similar than different, to be perfectly honest. She said she understands the vulnerability of individuals that live in the area, but she stated her clients are vulnerable themselves. Ms. Gilliam stated they have lost themselves. She stated NORA brings hope and life back to people that have lost their lives. Ms. Gilliam stated the individuals are fragile as well, they have lost of their health, a lot of their well-being with the loss of family members, people they have lost along the way, they feel disconnected. This is from the issue of loss after their bout with alcohol and drugs. She stated we help reconnect them within the society, we reconnect them with family. She said they look not to bring in criminal elements but to bring life and hope into these individuals. Ms. Gilliam stated there are 12-15 people and they do have two people that work every shift. She said she lives right around the corner and they call her every day and she is sure that will continue. She stated she will probably show up more often than she had originally planned. She stated that they currently volunteer here in the community at Musicians Towers in Cleveland Heights, at the senior citizen home there. Ms. Gilliam stated they also pass out food at the food bank the 3<sup>rd</sup> Tuesday of every month, and also deliver to their apartments. She offered a letter she had from them in their support. She read the letter out loud and it was given to our Assistant Law Director to go in the record. She added they also conduct programs on parenting, education on drugs and alcohol and, most important, they bring family back to the facility once a week to educate them and educate them back into their family life. Ms. Gilliam said that she appreciated the opportunity to speak on behalf of Northern Ohio Recovery Association and looks forward to their consideration.

Mr. Cobb asked that before she sits down, if she would confirm that she did take the oath. Mr. Cobb then asked if anyone had any questions for Ms. Gilliam.

Mr. Mattox, Jr. said he had two questions. He asked if this is an expansion or just a move to the area.

Ms. Gilliam answered they will be expanding from their current space, we are at 16 now and her understanding it will be up to 30.

His second question is, how do you connect with the women that you bring in for the program?

Ms. Gilliam answered that they receive referrals from a number of sources--the Department of Family Services is one. She said, most of the time, we have a 24-hour hotline with people calling in at all hours of the night. We then try to connect people as quickly as possible, because we know we have to get them in the heat of the moment when they are the most vulnerable. She stated when the people are sick and tired of being sick and tired. Often she stated they have families that bring them in and people come from very far, Elyria and Erie. They come because they do not have a lot in their area and these families are desperate. In addition we get them also from the courts.

Mr. Mattox, Jr. thanked her.

Mr. Cobb stated he had a couple of questions.

Mr. Cobb asked what are the requirements that you expect of your residents and under what were the circumstances if you ever had to ask people to leave? Have you ever had the issue come up because they are not following the rules and regulations that you have?

Ms. Gilliam replied absolutely. She answered that they have an orientation that they do when they first arrive at the facility. Initially, they may be foggy, so we do that for about three weeks until we feel that they really understand the rules and regulations. Ms. Gilliam stated that there are people who chose not to stay but we always link people to another care place. Ms. Gilliam stated they do not just discharge them with no place to go, we always find another facility to make sure that they can get the help that they need.

Mr. Cobb asked, in the past, in a given year, how many people have you had to ask to leave the program because they are not following what you expect them to be doing.

Ms. Gilliam answered that she did not know if she had a percentage or the number of individuals who are unsuccessful due to a discharge for not following the rules. She said it is not a high number. She stated that there are probably people who do not complete our program, there would be a greater number than that, and yet we do make sure that we link people, even if they are not going to do a residential service that we provide, we will connect them to an out-patient service at another location if that is a better fit for them.

Mr. Cobb asked if at their present location, have you had any security issues or concerns with people that coming to visit any of your residents?

Ms. Gilliam replied that she has been with NORA since August of 2013 and she has not had any concerns. She stated she has not had any issues with anyone from the outside, people in the program. She added they do not have a sign outside of the location which is purposely done. She said they have not had a lot of people that had any real issues with coming to visit their family.

Mr. Cobb asked if there were any instances where they had to have the police come to the facility.

Ms. Gilliam answered that they have had a couple of disturbances, where individuals were not being able to control, or something like that. She said that is maybe once or twice since she has been there, it is not commonplace.

Mr. Cobb asked if there were any questions in light of what he has asked.

Ms. Gilliam wanted to add that they do have two people on staff at all times. After the non-clinical hours, there are always two people there.

Mr. Cobb thanked Ms. Gilliam.

A gentleman came to the lectern and stated his name was Robert Walker and that he lives at 32228 W. 114<sup>th</sup> Street in Cleveland, Ohio. He stated he did take the oath previously. He stated he did not have much to add, he said he has been doing this for 30 years and he is also in recovery himself for 32 years, tomorrow actually. Mr. Walker stated he has seen a lot of things, good and bad, but the one thing he has seen over and over again. He said when people are alarmed about something like this moving into their community, is that there is going to be some kind of criminal element and the fear of what is this going to

mean. He stated what he has seen is the opposite happening. We just had a situation happen in Vermillion where we have a recovery housing program and it's a very affluent community and they were very worried about this, it is right on the lake there. He said there was an outcry from the community that they did not want this here. He stated that within two months, they were their best friends. He stated there is a nursing home right next to them there and the Spiritual Retreat is right across the street and now they come over to us. At Christmas time, they made the women dinner, they brought them presents, it really has the opposite effect of what people think is going to happen. He stated that the women who come to them, once they get a taste of recovery; they want to give back as a way of making up for their misdeeds with their family and friends. He said they end up being some of the best neighbors he has ever seen. Mr. Walker wants us to know these women will add to this neighborhood and certainly not detract from it. He stated these women are usually already their neighbors and their family members using drugs and alcohol instead of trying to get sober and give back to the community. He said this unit brings love, faith and Christianity to the neighborhood as opposed to taking away from. He did state that their current occupancy permit is for multi-family as a group home at our current location and asked if you need a copy of that.

Mr. Cobb asked before he sat down, were there any questions?

Ms. Cohen stated she was not sure he was the right person, but she had a question for the staff of NORA. Ms. Cohen stated she read in the staff report that there are children also that will be staying there. She asked about the support for the children, who makes sure they get to school, who's enrolling them in school, etc. Talk a bit about who is doing this while you are treating their mothers.

Ms. Gilliam came back to the lectern and stated again that she has been sworn in. She stated they do transport the children and actually their age limit is 10 years old, but they tend to get really young kids and they do enroll them into day care and they do have a day care and she said they also link them with Applewood to help in terms of if they have some behavioral issues. She said this helps the parent in their skills. She said her experience has not been middle schoolers or anything like that, more in daycare.

Ms. Cohen asked if their daycare is on another site or is that a room at this site.

Ms. Gilliam answered that they transport them; she said they transport clients everywhere. They go nowhere by themselves.

Mr. Cobb thanked her.

Mr. Cobb asked if there was anyone here from the public that wants to address the Commission on this.

A gentleman came to the lectern and stated his name is Julio Peltsman and he stated he lives at 24615 Sittingbourne Lane in Beachwood, 44122 and he is also a proud previous resident of Cleveland Heights and he is representing Council Gardens. He stated he is the incoming Chair of the Board. He stated they had some residents and staff people here tonight. He stated his director sent this letter to you. Mr. Peltsman said number one is that this is a business coming into a residential area. He stated it is going to bring people with mental and health disorders and they are very concerned because their residents are very old and vulnerable. The average age for their tenants is 80 and most residents are

aging in place with increasing levels of fragility. He said many are mobility impaired and use walkers and wheelchairs. He stated a high percentage of his tenants are also refugees from the former Soviet Union and have limited English speaking skills. He stated this makes them easy targets for scams. He said they have gone to great lengths to protect their tenants, special locks on all doors, security cameras throughout the property. He said there is extra outdoor lighting with extra maintenance men who circle our property at all hours and a secure main entrance with a police officer. He stated Council Gardens follows strict guidelines, approved by HUD, regarding renting to a tenant who is involved or has been involved in drug or criminal activities. We want to provide our tenants with a secure and safe environment--that is our top priority.

Mr. Cobb thanked him.

Mr. Cobb stated he probably should have brought this up before anyone spoke, our Assistant Law Director wanted everyone to be aware that to the extent that we were to take into consideration the fact that anyone had a substance abuse problem, under federal law that is the same as if they had a handicap so the mere fact that they have a substance abuse problem or a mental disorder is not anything that this Commission is permitted to take into consideration as to whether this Conditional Use Permit should be granted or not.

Ms. Rothenberg added that the Planning Commission does have the power to review, it can look at sorts of factors about how the neighborhood would be affected and the number of deliveries and city resources, she did not want you to get the impression that they have no power here. It is illegal for them to consider the other facts and we wanted to make sure everyone was aware of this.

Ms. Rothenberg swore in a woman who spoke out from the audience.

A woman came to the lectern and stated that her name is Jackie Feldman and that her residence is 25215 Shaker Boulevard in Beachwood, OH but that her place of work is 2501 North Taylor Road in Cleveland Heights and she stated she has been sworn in . She stated she is the Director of Community Relations for Council Gardens in Cleveland Heights. She stated that she wanted to express how admirable we think this project is and we are all for assisting people in need, regardless of what that need is, and what issues they may be struggling with. She did have a few questions in terms of this being a residential facility and a business, and the containment of this business on this exact property where it is proposed to be housed. She stated that because the Council Gardens property is immediately adjacent, there is absolutely nothing preventing anyone from coming in from off the street onto the Council Gardens property. She stated that most of the residents spend a considerable amount of time outdoors. She said they have a very large community gardening program, all of which takes place on the premises of Council Gardens outside the buildings. She stated that many of these elderly are fragile and even the handicapped residents are out of doors frequently late into the evening tending to their gardens or strolling on our property. She stated the question is because this is a residential facility, what if any measures are taken to contain the residents on the property where they are supposed to be.

Ms. Feldman stated that their main concern is that basically both of the properties are completely open and that is what the neighborhood is about. It is about being neighborly and Temple Imani has been a wonderful neighbor, by the way, and we have a wonderful

relationship with them. She stated because of the way the properties are laid out, there is absolutely nothing we can do to prevent them from walking around the neighborhood.

Ms. Gilliam came back to the lectern to address the concerns of Ms. Feldman. She stated there is containment, but she said there is one thing to note. She said there are 29 plus hours of programming a week so that leaves very little time for being outside, to be perfectly honest. She stated when they do go outside, or when we have any type of social activity, they are always with a staff member and they never can go out by themselves. She said it is not part of the program. She stated they have to be able to watch where they are and what they are doing at all times. She stated the schedule is pretty regimented as far as what they do and when they do it. She said between the doctor's appointments that we take them to and the hours of programming they go to, they get very little time to spend outside. Remember there is always a staff member with them at all times. She asked if she answered that adequately.

Ms. Cohen asked to ask staff a question. She asked if there was a discussion about fencing at all within the application or within the process.

Ms. Hamley O' Donnell answered no.

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell added that she received a phone call today that she promised she would relay to all tonight.

Mr. Cobb asked if there was anyone else who wished to speak on this.

A woman came to the lectern and stated her name is Kathleen Szymanski, 3459 Edison Road, Cleveland Heights. She stated she is a social worker and works with homeless and recovering addicts. She asked them how they get their money, who pays for this agency.

Ms. Rothenberg stated that questions have to be directed to the Planning Commission first.

Ms. Szymanski asked again how this is funded. She stated that she feels good about the fact that – she said usually people are devastated if they have to be kicked out of a shelter in the morning and not be able to go back until the evening with some of the homeless shelters. They go down to Cosgrove center and hang around there. She said it sounds good what you have planned, she wonders also about the children because you are doing so much with the parents that these kids have to have activities and they have get outside and have fresh air. She added that she knows that Imani has Mother's Day activities outside with music and everything. She stated to her it seems it might be a good plan.

Mr. Cobb asked if she had taken the oath and she answered yes.

Mr. Cobb thanked her.

A woman came to the lectern and stated her name is Anita Bradley and she was sworn in. She began with saying that she wanted to talk a bit about funding. She stated that most of their money is federal dollars and from the Department of Health and Human Services. She stated they do a lot of grant writing. Ms. Bradley said they have Medicaid contacts with the State of Ohio and funding from the Ohio Department of Alcohol and Mental Health Services in Columbus, and we also have a relationship with Cuyahoga County. Ms. Bradley stated they have done some fundraisers and have had foundations and now with the Affordable

Care Act, everyone has insurance and we are able to treat more people. She stated as far as the children are concerned, one of the things that is very appealing to this particular site is that there is a playground and there is grass. She stated they are hoping they can take the children out from time to time and supervise them, just like we do at the daycare but this will be evening hours. She stated that they do have children that are receiving treatment and they have been building this program for a while. She stated they were a grassroots organization, literally in 2004 when they started with the one grant and 6 employees and now 64 employees, which speaks to the need in the community. She stated they have been recruited to go to other areas because there are not a lot of us, some places are isolated. She mentioned that some of you may know of the opiate crisis that we are really trying to address. Ms. Bradley said they do a prevention program and this is not something that they do here. As far as the children are concerned, they are Monday through Friday at the daycare. She said they take them over there and then in the evenings they are with their parents. She said the mothers do go out in the evenings to 12-Step meetings and they go to church. Ms. Bradley stated that where they are now, they are able to go to church on Sunday if that is something they desire. We can't force that on them, but it is available. Ms. Bradley added that the funding is mostly Federal and this year they were at \$3.4 million and the year before, about \$2.7 million. It seems to ebb and flow and, for the most part, there is a lot of growth over the last 11 years. She said they have been constantly going. She wanted to add that they hire people that are licensed and certified, we don't just have people that fill out resumes, but the staff is clinical, Dr. C is a psychologist and Bob is a Clinical Director for 30 years. She said she is a licensed social worker, a licensed counselor; All of them, in one form or another, have some sort of credentials and have gone to college. She did say that there are some that have not gone to college but many of them have been in recovery work for a long time, so for volunteers we ask them to have two years' experience and for clinical staff they have to have three years if they are a person in recovery.

A man stood up from the audience and asked to be sworn in. He came to the lectern and stated his name is Reginal McKissick and he is a resident of Cleveland Heights for over 28 years. He is a Maintenance Director at Council Gardens and has been there 26 years and one of his questions is about security. He wanted to know how can they maintain security in the middle of night and how can they control other family members from coming in at any time when they are not supposed to be there. He was concerned how this can be maintained 24 hours a day.

Mr. Cobb asked if he did take the oath and he answered that he did.

Ms. Bradley came to the lectern stating she did take the oath. She started with saying that when she read the letter, one of the first things she thought about, we have more similarities than differences. Ms. Bradley explained that they actually have cameras on the facility pointing to the different areas so we can see what is going on. She said they are very private and do not have signs outside of their facility advertising their business. She stated that family members can come and visit their loved ones and usually they are very supportive. She said they have a very structured program, where they come in and they are educated by the counselor about the disease of addiction so that they know when the person is discharged, how to treat them, and what to expect. Ms. Bradley said she could not even remember any time that there was a problem with a boyfriend coming there to harm anyone. She stated there have been more concerns with the neighborhood and the other people outside of their facility. She stated her experience with families is that they are relieved that their loved one is in a secure environment. She said one thing about

addiction is that they need to be removed from their environment for a period of time to make sure, she said they are sober when they are with them, they are already detoxed, so we need to make sure we educate them so that when they do leave, they are ready to go back into the world. She said no security issues. One of the reasons we have the two staff is because if you have some people inside the facility and a few that want to go to a meeting or playground, both locations are covered. They said they have liability insurance, and directors insurance, so all those things are in place.

Mr. Cobb thanked her.

Ms. Gilliam came to the lectern again and stated she has been sworn in. She wanted to add that visitation is set for once a week on Sundays from 1-5 p.m. They can only visit if they have gone through the family education which is on Wednesday, that is a requirement. They have to go through the program so they can understand the process and then come visit once a week. She stated even the visits are supervised so they can't be by themselves. She wanted to speak further on the confidentiality issue. She stated that when people call up and ask about a resident, we give out no information and she wanted to give some reassurance as it pertains to that.

Ms. Cohen wanted to ask if there is a curfew at the facility.

Ms. Gilliam answered they are with us so they do not typically go anywhere by themselves. If they are with a sponsor the curfew is 5 p.m. and a meeting is required. During the week they are with us so there is no need for a curfew.

Ms. Cohen thanked her.

A woman came to the lectern stating her name is Deborah Baker, 19830 Winslow Circle, Shaker Heights, 44122 and she has been affirmed. She stated she is the Program Manager for the Next Step Recovery House which is a partner of this site. She wanted to add that they have beautifully described what happens inside, but she heard them say she has a very good and positive relationship with the Imani Temple and if you can imagine the people that go in and out of Imani Temple, they come from everywhere. She stated that many are coming for healing and restoration. Many have been injured in a lot of different ways and we provide the same kind of service under the same type of umbrella for recovery, healing restoration so when woman come in, if you can imagine, the atmosphere and the environment that we work very hard to achieve, it is one of respect, of unconditional love, it is one of kindness and patience and temperance. She stated they teach that as we model that, so we then see it emulated. She stated they create a peer support system where the woman and the children support and encourage one another and this is how the healing is facilitated. She said this is very important to us and that the environment that you will find under the roof of the Imani Temple is what we strive very hard to create at NORA.

Mr. Cobb thanked her.

A woman came back to the lectern, Kathlene Szymanski who was sworn in already. She wondered about the 16-bed facility and was it difficult and do you not have room for 30 in Shaker Heights. She also asked if they are granted to come into the rectory, would there be periodic newsletters to the neighbors letting us know how things are going, if there is a wish list. She said maybe someone at Council Gardens might want to be a grandma or

grandpa to some of the kids. She wondered what happened to the veterans and why did you grant it and what happened with that.

Mr. Cobb replied that someone from staff will answer that.

Mr. Cobb asked if she had any other questions.

Anita Bradley came back to the lectern and stated she was sworn in. She stated that currently the facility they are in is smaller than this site. There are many repairs that need to be done and so this is a better facility for them. She stated it allows them to expand somewhat the bed space and that is needed. She said that part of the reason they are able to retain the grants from Health and Human Services is because we make the argument when we write our grants that there is a capacity issue in Ohio and this county and people are going to jail and institutions when they need to be in a facility like we have. Her concern she has with jail, if they are housed in jail, they are not learning and getting the knowledge, the healing and the restoration. She said they are able to give them that tool so that they can make better choices. She added that the newsletter is definitely a possibility. She said they actually have a newsletter right now. She stated they work in East Cleveland, as well, they have something they call East Cleveland Bridges of Hope which is a coalition which is funded through the White House and partnerships with Health and Human Services. She said that is about environmental services and working with about 12 different sectors to try to reduce the onset of alcoholism for adolescents.

Mr. Cobb asked before she went to sit down if we grant this Conditional Use Permit, if you would be willing meet with their Executive Director and exchange contact information.

She replied that she absolutely would and she had tried to call the Director and did not get through.

A gentleman came to the lectern and stated his name is Thomas Boyd and that he is with the Imani Temple Ministries and he has been sworn in. He wanted to respond to your question about the Veterans Group. We initially wanted them to come in and got the ok from the City but apparently their funding ran dry and they were not able to move forward with the project.

Mr. Cobb thanked him.

Another gentleman came to the lectern and stated his name was Bob Walker and had been sworn in previously. He wanted to talk about the expansion and us adding more beds, but really that is not the main goal. He stated that they really want to improve the environment for the women and that really speaks to what we want to do. He stated they want to create an environment for women that have never had a good environment to be in. He refers to their Vermillion project, that place is nicer than his own personal home. He stated he wants to give them the most positive environment to start to expect to be treated like he wants his daughter to be treated, like he wants his neighbors to be treated. He wants them when they leave there, to go into and expect to live in a good environment and they should be treated well by their family and by their spouses and children. We want them to become the type of person that they really want to be.

Ms. Cohen asked if the rectory right now in move-in condition and if not, was there an agreement between the center and Imani as to what improvements would be needed on the site.

A man named Thomas Boyd stated the rectory is in move-in condition and they just need to bring in the furnishings that they need to use.

A woman came to the lectern and stated her name is Barbara Mervine and that she was the Executive Director of Council Gardens and that she lives at 2044 S. Belvoir in South Euclid, 44121. She had a question for them about the reasonable accommodations and what you had mentioned that the Assistant Law Director stated, I would like that clarified. Also if anybody actually tried to call me and you did not say, Council Gardens Executive Director. She stated she is 100% available and return calls every single call she gets. She stated that at this point she is more interested in what you were talking about that the Assistant Law Director wanted you to know. Ms. Mervine asked her to explain the reasonable accommodation, what you had mentioned in the beginning that you had failed to talk about.

Ms. Rothenberg then reiterated that they wanted to make sure that everyone in the room understood that the fact that the tenants will be people who have what has been defined by a Federal Law as a disability and this cannot be taken into account by the Planning Commission.

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell asked to speak about the phone call she received today. She stated that she spoke with Julie Klament who was not able to make it tonight and asked her to pass her concerns to the Commission. Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated that she lives at 3492 Glen Allen and she said that she was concerned and against transforming the rectory to a nursing home facility or a treatment facility. She was concerned that the building would not be adequate to house such a facility. She was concerned that it was inadequate to meet a really good high level residential care recovery facility and noted the fragility of her community.

Mr. Cobb stated that he seems to recall that in the last year, there was an applicant that was putting a facility over on Overlook, did that go in and if there were any issues or problems with them?

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell replied that the adult facility went in and she thought the youth facility is on hold but the adult facility has been in for a year now. She stated that she has not had any complaints about it. Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated that it was housing for people with eating disorders who were coming there to live for several months to receive treatment and counseling and medical care in that facility and that has been there for about a year.

Mr. Cobb stated he wanted her to speak on that because there were some concerns that it was going to be in a residential neighborhood whether there was going to be any issues or problems.

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell said that she has had a lot of conversations with neighbors who were concerned beforehand but she has not had any calls from any of those neighbors who were concerned before the approval. She stated it is on Overlook Road, on the edge of Cleveland Heights and Cleveland.

Mr. Mattox, Jr. wanted to say a few words. He stated that he has been a resident of Cleveland Heights his entire life and as a member of the Planning Commission and being involved in the community and also a pastor of a church here, right off of Noble Road in East Cleveland. He stated that one of the things he loves about Cleveland Heights is our diversity and in that it all means that there are people in our community who are marginalized and have needs and in many cases are overlooked. He stated he is excited about seeing so many different types of people who get to experience our city. It allows him to see their experiences and learn and understand more about them and who they are. He stated that is what makes Cleveland Heights amazing for him, is that his children and wife and I are able to see many types of people from many walks of life that helps improve who we are. He stated he is excited about businesses and organizations continue to come into the community; he thinks that is what makes us great. He stated he looks forward to more opportunities throughout this city, he feels diversity is key in terms of understanding people, their struggles, their walks in life and getting a different viewpoint on how things are. He wanted to say he is looking forward to whatever happens here.

Mr. Cobb stated while he has the floor, is there a motion he would like to make.

Mr. Mattox, Jr. made the motion to approve Project 16-10 with the recommendations from staff.

Mr. Cobb asked for a second.

Mr. Howe seconded the motion.

Mr. Horowitz wanted to say he served on City Council from 1982 – 1993 and then hid away for a few years and on Planning Commission for about the last 18 years. He stated that over that time there have been quite a few projects that involved group homes, homes for mentally retarded and various conditions and almost every time there was neighborhood concern about what is going to happen. He stated, without fail, these things have all become quiet neighbors, just doing what they do. He hopes this all goes smoothly for you.

Ms. Rothenberg stated that this permit is conditional and can be revoked if they do not meet the conditions or if it becomes a bad neighbor, you need to call Ms. Hamley O'Donnell and if it can't be worked out, it can come back before the Planning Commission and be revoked, so this is not permanent. This is conditioned upon what they just voted on.

Ms. Cohen wanted to say from an intergenerational perspective, just the fact that these kids will be in stable environment, she thinks is critical and that there could be a lot of partnership between and a lot gained by having those kids and the residents of Council Gardens brought together.

Mr. Cobb stated we are not quite done yet.

Mr. Wong stated that they had a public meeting about the Master Plan two weeks ago with nearly 100 people. He said he will keep them posted but a lot of it is on the website. He stated there is also a survey out there.

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell stated she will e-mail the link to them tomorrow.

The meeting adjourned at 8:30 PM.

---

Michael Ungar, Chair

---

Richard Wong, Secretary

/kc