

CITY OF CLEVELAND HEIGHTS
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES OF THE MEETING
SEPTEMBER 20, 2016

MEMBERS PRESENT: Melissa Fliegel Chair
 Michael Wellman
 Erik Lund

STAFF PRESENT: Kara Hamley O'Donnell City Planner
 Elizabeth Rothenberg Assistant Law Director

CALL TO ORDER

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. at which time all members were present.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE SEPTEMBER 5, 2016 PUBLIC HEARING

ABR members had no corrections or comments so the minutes were approved as submitted and signed by Ms. Fliegel.

**PUBLIC HEARING
SEPTEMBER 20, 2016**

Ms. Hamley O'Donnell was sworn in for all cases.

ABR 2016-110, continued until no later than 11/7/16: Request of Uri Schulgasser, 1853 S. Compton, to construct 2½ -car garage with upper floor.

- No new drawings submitted, case will remain on the agenda.

ABR 2016-123, continued until no later than 11/7/16: Request of Ellary Oliver, 1247 Quilliams, to replace two front windows with bay window.

- No new drawings submitted, case will remain on the agenda.

ABR 2016-141: Request of Gene Sardon, 3344 Euclid Heights Boulevard, at rear of house, to patch existing shingles, replace door with window where former porch/balcony was demolished, and to install step unit.

- Gene Sardon, 3344 Euclid Heights Boulevard, who was sworn in, explained that there is an upstairs door and lower door that have no landing/balcony/step unit. He would like to replace the 2nd floor door with a window to match the one to the right—same height and same width and same sill height. On the first floor he would like to build a small wooden stairway to access the grade. He showed photos of a similar project that he would emulate.
- Mr. Lund verified that the window would match that to the side—same height and same width.
- Mr. Wellman noted it was at the back of the house. He asked what kind of wood he would use.

- Mr. Sardon said they would match existing materials and size and it would be uniform. Same style and shape of singles.
- Ms. Fliegel noted the specifications said the porch will be wood, primed and painted.

ACTION: APPROVED. Ms. Fliegel made a motion to approve as submitted. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2016-140: Request of Phillip Weeden, Naturally Gifted Fitness, 1633-35 Lee Road, for 13.5 s.f. sign.

- Denise Pierson, Naturally Gifted Fitness manager, 1633-35 Lee Road, who was sworn in showed the drawings.
- Ms. Hamley O'Donnell noted that the signs were installed without City permission and they were asked to come before you for review and to obtain a sign permit.
- Commission members had no concerns.

ACTION: APPROVED. Mr. Lund made a motion to approve as submitted. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2016-125: Request of Ed Locci, 12876 Cedar Road, to replace 2-car, detached garage in same location.

- Diane Bija, New Creation Builders, 5309 Barquell Avenue, Cleveland, stated they are replacing the garage that was storm damaged. It is going in exact same location.

ACTION: APPROVED. Ms. Fliegel made a motion to approve as submitted. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2016-126: Request of Chantel Cornell, d.b.a. Alt"her"Ego Boutique & Body Bar, 3944 Mayfield Road, to install 12 s.f. sign.

- Chantel Cornell, 3944 Mayfield, Cleveland Heights, who was sworn in, showed her drawings.
- Ms. Fliegel was happy to see a vacancy filled.
- Mr. Lund noted it was going in the existing opening where a sign had previously been located.

ACTION: APPROVED. Mr. Wellman made a motion to approve as submitted. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2016-127: Request of Jane Baus, 3366 East Fairfax Road, to replace 2-car, detached garage in same location.

- Steve Mazzone, Godfather Garages, 3601 Clark Avenue, was sworn in.
- Victor Serna, 3372 E. Fairfax, neighbor, was sworn in.
- Mr. Mazzone said the new garage will have a 4/12 gable roof rather than a shed like the existing garage. It will have siding and roof shingles to match the house. Garage will be gray with white trim and white doors.
- Mr. Lund said the pitch of the garage was similar to the pitch of the porches. He asked if a door was on each side.
- Mr. Mazzone said there would be one garage on the yard (left) side.

- Mr. Serna, neighbor, noted that he had lead issues in his family. He was concerned about lead issues with removal of the garage. In his opinion, the contractor should be certified in lead abatement so that airborne lead particles would not affect his children.
- Ms. Fliegel noted that this would be something to be brought up with the Building Department.
- Mr. Lund noted that the garage structure could be hosed down during demolition to keep the lead dust down.

ACTION: APPROVED. Mr. Wellman made a motion to approve as submitted. Seconded by Ms. Fliegel, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2016-128: Request of 2284-86 S. Overlook Road LLC, 2284 S. Overlook Road, to replace 3-car, detached garage in same location.

- Carmen Iammarino, owner, business address, 12026 Mayfield, who was sworn in, noted the garage was torn down due to safety concerns.
- Ms. Fliegel was confirming that the proposed pitch is 6/12 because the section shows 4/12 section. It was agreed that a 6/12 pitch was proposed and was labeled on more drawings.
- Mr. Iammarino said the garage would be wood frame with vinyl siding. The house is aluminum sided.
- Mr. Lund asked if the pattern on the double door would match the pattern on single door, as the drawing seemed to indicate otherwise.
- Mr. Iammarino said that it would.

ACTION: APPROVED AS NOTED with a 6/12 pitch and garage door paneling size to match on both two doors. Mr. Lund made a motion to approve as submitted. Seconded by Ms. Fliegel, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2016-129: Request of Suella Wilfong, 1933 Staunton Road, to replace 8 front windows with window grid pattern different from original.

- Chris Hall, Pella Windows, 26150 Richmond Road, Bedford Heights, who was sworn in, noted that a few months ago a permit was pulled to match the existing 12/1 grid patterns and the owner asked for revisions. The eight front windows will be changed to a 6/1 sash; current is 12/1 sash.
- Ms. Fliegel asked why the reduction.
- Mr. Hall said she wants less obstruction on the upper sash. They are architect series.
- Mr. Wellman said it doesn't change the character and Ms. Fliegel agreed. They asked if side windows were being replaced and Mr. Hall said that was a future phase and was expected to match the 6/1 sash proposed tonight.

ACTION: APPROVED. Mr. Wellman made a motion to approve as submitted. Seconded by Ms. Fliegel, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2016-130: Request of Cecil Peterson, 3002 Kensington, to replace existing 2-car, detached garage in same location.

- Dominic Laudato, of Paul Davis, 11900 Washington Street, Auburn, and Cecil Peterson, 3002 Kensington, who had been sworn in, came to the table.

- Mr. Laudato said that a tree fell on the Petersons' garage and they are replacing the existing garage. Siding and shingles will match existing damaged garage with a 4/12 roof pitch.
- Mr. Cecil Peterson said he may replace the pad.
- Mr. Lund had no objections.

ACTION: APPROVED. Mr. Lund made a motion to approve as submitted. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2016-131: Request of Paul Sullivan, 3060 Edgehill Road, to replace 3 windows on side of house; 1 large double hung window proposed to be replaced with a fixed picture window.

- Joe Perri, Stanek Windows, 700 E. Highland Road, Macedonia, who was sworn in, stated there is a 50" wide double-hung that is inoperable and the resident is worried about safety and opening a window that large. It is on the side of the house. He noted that it was a later replacement and heavy to lift. He was also concerned about someone breaking in.
- Ms. Fliegel said it was acceptable and Mr. Wellman agreed.

ACTION: APPROVED. Ms. Fliegel made a motion to approve as submitted. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2016-132: Request of CH-UH City School District, Heights High, 13263 Cedar Road, to construct baseball dugout, softball dugout and identification sign.

Identification signs--temporary

- Pat O'Brien, CHUH, 2155 Miramar and John Orsini, BHSM Architects, who had been sworn in, came to the table to present their proposal for dugouts and additional temporary site identification signs.
- Mr. Orsini showed that two temporary identification signs were proposed to be mounted on board on the temporary construction fence.
- Mr. Orsini showed where the site signage would be located.
- Mr. Wellman confirmed they were temporary.
- Mr. O'Brien said they were and would be mounted on plywood mounted on the fence.
- Mr. Orsini said it was a building identification sign.

ACTION: IDENTIFICATION SIGNS APPROVED. Ms. Fliegel made a motion to approve additional temporary identification signs as submitted. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion passed unanimously.

Dugouts

- Mr. Orsini explained that the baseball field was reoriented from its past location. Fencing will be reoriented and new dugouts will be constructed for both baseball and softball fields. Like many high schools, they are block construction with a simple sloped roof. There is a bench inside with fencing for protection. Mr. Orsini shared the plans of simple structure with a small storage room for each softball and baseball field.
- Mr. Orsini shared the block color, Cordova Stone "buff" or Cordova Stone "light buff" in the split-face block. The lighter color matches the stone on high school.

- Mr. Lund said the baseball dugouts complement the building and are more in the center of the site.
- Ms. Fliegel said that she struggled with the location of the softball dugouts because they are so close to the houses.
- Mr. Lund said he wouldn't be happy if he lived in one of the houses across the street, it seems too simple for being that close to the street.
- Mr. Wellman asked if they thought about changing the softball field orientation. Mr. O'Brien said they took their direction on field siting from the Athletic Department.
- Mr. O'Brien noted that the softball dugouts were originally just chain link and could be seen through but they wanted to have equity between the boys' and girls' programs. He understood they didn't like a plain masonry building.
- Mr. Lund thought something with more design could fit into the neighborhood. Split-face on the corner is probably not that way. We wouldn't approve this in someone's front yard.
- Mr. Hamley O'Donnell noted that landscaping was part of the original boys' dugout approval.
- Mr. O'Brien noted landscaping could be installed.
- Ms. Fliegel asked the premium of a more attractive block.
- Mr. O'Brien asked what you thought was a better outcome.
- Mr. Orsini said you would just screen the softball fields and not the internal baseball fields.
- Ms. Fliegel felt that solid masonry vs. split-face were both solid and not best at this residential section of the site.
- Ms. Hamley O'Donnell asked if a dugout had to have a back.
- Mr. Orsini said you would probably put a fence in it so it couldn't serve as a hiding place.
- Ms. Fliegel doesn't feel an opening requirement for the baseball dugouts is a needed due to its location internally in the site. They should propose some landscaping or openings on the outside walls of the softball dugouts.
- Mr. Lund said it needs study to how it engages the neighborhood and the four-way intersection. It could feel like an entrance to the campus from the northeast. Study the materials, massing or landscaping solution.

ACTION: CONTINUED FOR UP TO 45 DAYS (JUNE 4, 2016) TO CONTINUE DUGOUT DESIGN. Ms. Fliegel made a motion to continue. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion passed unanimously.

Identification sign--permanent

- Mr. Orsini showed how the top piece of the 1959 Heights High sign was saved and he showed how they would create a simple red brick base and set the 1959 sign on top of the base. They want to keep it simple and clean.

ACTION: APPROVED. Ms. Fliegel made a motion to approve as submitted. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion passed unanimously.

Directional signs

- Mr. Orsini noted there was needed directional signage. He showed the proposed signage package. They are simple panel signs and colors will be white metal. Because the site is pretty straightforward, they have them at the entries. Signs are about 4" thick.
- Ms. Fliegel asked colors and sizes.
- Mr. Orsini said they would be anodized aluminum with brown letters. Fixtures are brown on the site. We can review the color. He can bring samples when they come back for the dugouts.
- Mr. Wellman said the design was okay, but we just need to review the specific materials and colors.

ACTION: CONTINUED FOR UP TO 45 DAYS (JUNE 4, 2016) TO CLARIFY FINAL SIGNAGE DESIGN AND MATERIALS.

ABR 2016-133: Request of Nexgen Investments, 1140 Sylvania Road, to construct new entrance portico.

- Eli Mahler, 3947 West Ash Lane, Orange Village, who was sworn in, stated they are rebuilding a portico and stoop. We will match the shingles and the siding at the front gable. There are stone steps that we will connect to.
- Mr. Lund said he thought it looked nice. He asked about the wrought iron railing and the other railing that is wood. Mr. Lund noted wrought iron is more durable under the elements.
- Mr. Wellman thought it looked nice.

ACTION: APPROVED. Mr. Lund made a motion to continue. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2016-134: Request of Linda Cole, 728 Quilliams Road, to remove existing rear deck, balcony and enclosed porch and build new deck with seasonal sunroom; remove second floor door.

- Linda Cole, 728 Quilliams Road, and Damian Dempsey, Patio Enclosures, 700 E. Highland, Macedonia, who were sworn in, came to the table.
- Mr. Lund asked if they were replacing the existing enclosure and infilling the door onto the roof.
- Mr. Dempsey said there is a door leading out of the second floor bedroom. That door is not part of this project.
- Ms. Fliegel said that the door on the second floor may be a building code issue. The new porch has a sloped roof.
- Mr. Wellman asked if the roof pitch was flat enough to not impact the second floor door.
- Mr. Lund thought that the door was going away since it wasn't shown on the elevation.
- Mr. Dempsey said the slope is low and you can walk on the roof.
- Mr. Wellman asked if the foam finish has a texture.
- Mr. Dempsey responded that it did.
- Mr. Lund said he doesn't have an issue with the sunroom. You should consider changing it from a door to a window or put some sort of safety railing.
- Ms. Cole said that she would be happy to change the second floor door to a window.
- Ms. Fliegel if you are going through a construction disruption, you would be happier to change the door to a window at the same time.
- Mr. Dempsey asked if they could replace the door with a double hung that matches the double hung on the rear of the back. They would infill siding to match existing siding

ACTION: APPROVED AS NOTED. Mr. Lund made a motion to approve with the condition that the second floor door above the sunroom be replaced with a window to match the existing rear window and the area below the window be filled with siding to match existing siding. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2016-135: Request of Barbara Kathman, 3272 Clarendon Road, to construct deck and seasonal sunroom at rear of house.

- Barbara Kathman, 3272 Clarendon Road, and Damian Dempsey, Patio Enclosures, 700 E. Highland, Macedonia, were sworn in and came to the table.
- Mr. Lund asked if it was an addition or replacing something.
- Ms. Kathman said that she had a deck approved but decided she wanted a sunroom instead.

ACTION: APPROVED. Ms. Fliegel made a motion to approve as submitted. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2016-136: Request of Peggy Spaeth, 2994 Essex Road, to install 3 windows on 2nd floor, rear of house, where there is currently one window.

- Chuck Miller, Doty & Miller Architects, 3368 Mayfield Road, Cleveland Heights, who was sworn in, noted the owner was remodeling a bedroom and would like to change one window on the back to three windows as shown in the drawings.

ACTION: APPROVED. Mr. Wellman made a motion to approve as submitted. Seconded by Ms. Fliegel, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2016-137: Request of Michelle Thomas, dba Upscale Fitness, 3102 Mayfield Road, to install 14 s.f. sign.

- Applicant did not attend.

ACTION: NO ACTION TAKEN.

ABR 2016-138: Request of Active Investment, 3274 E. Overlook, to build 2-car garage on existing foundation.

- Applicant did not attend.

ACTION: NO ACTION TAKEN.

ABR 2016-139: Request of William Hanna, 3039 Scarborough Road, to replace existing vinyl siding, remodel front entry porch, and add garage trellis.

- William Hanna, 3039 Scarborough Road, and David Maniet, Don Tarantino Architects, 1802 Radnor Road, who had both been sworn in, came to the table. Mr. Maniet explained a restoration to bring back the home's original character. We will remove existing siding and install new vinyl siding, adding trim board and friezes. The front entry porch will be redone--the current entry is too shallow. Steps will be leveled to achieve a consistent riser height. The plan calls to create a trellis area between the garage and the house.
- Mr. Maniet showed house photos and how the trim was eliminated when the house was originally sided and they will bring back casings and detail.
- All agreed it will be nice.
- Mr. Hanna asked if some of the vinyl details can be optional. He wants to focus on exposing the window trim because it is buried. He also prioritizes putting back the corner boards. He was not

sure about the skirt board and frieze and said that he hopes that is not mandated. It may be too expensive. He is planning on casing the trim in aluminum. He noted they are also doing insulation.

- Ms. Fliegel appreciated that he was trying to redo the vinyl and bring back the details.
- Mr. Lund said you have a tasteful approach and he trusts where you are headed. The porch will be nice.

ACTION: APPROVED. Mr. Wellman made a motion to approve with the condition that major modifications would have to come back to the ABR for review. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion passed unanimously.

ABR 2016-142: Request of Mich Morsio, 1761 Radnor Road, to replace existing 2-car, detached garage in same location.

- Diane Bijai, New Creation, 5309 Barkwell Road, Cleveland, who was sworn in, said they are building a garage to match original in same location. Proposal is for 4/12 pitch.
- Mr. Wellman noted the pitch on the drawing was 4/12 but we would prefer a 6/12 pitch.

ACTION: APPROVED AS NOTED. Ms. Fliegel made a motion to approve with a 6/12 pitch. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion passed unanimously.

Old Business—Administrative Review

ABR 2016-96, from 9/7/16 meeting: Request of James & Julie Love, 3185 Oak Road, to alter existing garage & add new metal roof.

- Mr. Lund said this was an unusual approach.
- Ms. Fliegel asked what is in the face of the gable. When he was describing what he was doing, it seemed okay. At the two sides, if it slopes, will he have to square that off?
- Mr. Wellman noted that it slopes to the back.
- Mr. Lund said he was putting a carport over his garage. Ms. Fliegel noted “inside” his existing garage.
- Mr. Wellman said the side elevation is not solvable.
- Ms. Fliegel said he must submit a line drawing showing what is going on. These details are more complex than he understands them to be. Photoshopping these onto existing photos is not sufficient to understand how the details will be addressed.
- Mr. Wellman said we need project-specific architectural drawings.
- Mr. Lund these are standard drawings for a very specific situation..
- The Board agreed the direction is improved, but we need project specific elevations and details and call out materials, specifically the roof elevations and roof gable to clarify how infill will occur.

ACTION: NO ACTION TAKEN.

ABR 2016-088, from 9/7/16 meeting: Request of Heights Medical Building LLC, 2460 Fairmount Boulevard, to review building signage plan.

- Discussion of dimensions. Commission reviewed the revised drawings.

Sign Plan

ACTION: APPROVED. Ms. Fliegel made a motion to approve the sign plan as submitted. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion passed unanimously.

CLE Dental Sign

ACTION: APPROVED. Ms. Fliegel made a motion to approve the sign plan as submitted. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion passed unanimously.

OLD BUSINESS

No old business was brought before the ABR.

NEW BUSINESS

No new business was brought before the ABR.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 8:52 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,



Richard Bozic, Chair

5 OCT 16.

date



Richard Wong, Secretary

October 5, 2016

date

11.11.11

11.11.11