

CITY OF CLEVELAND HEIGHTS
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES OF THE MEETING
JUNE 21, 2016

MEMBERS PRESENT: Melissa Fliegel Acting Chair
 Michael Wellman
 Erik Lund

STAFF PRESENT: Elizabeth Rothenberg Assistant Law Director
 Richard Wong Planning Director

CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Wong called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. at which time all members were present.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE JUNE 7, 2016 PUBLIC HEARING

Members suggested no corrections so the minutes were approved as submitted and signed by Ms. Fliegel.

PUBLIC HEARING

JUNE 21, 2016

ABR 2016.-065: Request of Samuel Gibson and Ellen Malone, 2457

Demington Drive, to construct 6'-high wooden fence enclosing rear yard and part of Demington yard no less than 30' from Demington public sidewalk.

Mr. Wong, who was sworn-in, presented slides to describe the context and the proposal. He explained that the fence was the subject of a Board of Zoning Appeals variance last Wednesday that was continued. A 6'-high fence is proposed set back from Demington Drive at least 33.3' from the right-of-way. Since the home is 46.8' from the right-of-way, the allowable fence height is 3' and a variance is needed.

Mr. Lund asked if the wood material was to be cedar or pressure-treated.

Sam Gibson and Ellen Malone, who had both been sworn-in, said they had not decided.

Mr. Wong stated that the neighbors had been notified of the Board of Zoning Appeals' request and sent the letters that the ABR members had been provided.

Ms. Fliegel asked if they had considered other types of fences.

Mr. Gibson said they did not want to use iron or chain link. In reply to a question about neighbors' preferences, he said this proposal was revised from their original proposal that was a more plain-looking board-on-board fence with no lattice or spindles in the top part.

Mr. Lund said it would have been within their right to use a fully solid fence if it had been set back as far as the house. He had no problem with a 6'-high fence set back as proposed.

Mr. Wellman said he had served on the Board of Zoning Appeals. In past fence variances, transparency was sought when the fence was very close to the street. This proposal is far away and will be less noticed. He wanted verification that the ABR was only to focus on the appearance of the fence, not its setback.

Mr. Wong said members were reviewing the fence's look with respect to its proposed location and context. While they could not approve the location, they could approve its appearance at that location.

Ms. Malone said the revised top looks good and is in keeping with the English brick cottage style of their home [the home has elements of Arts and Crafts, which originated in England].

Mr. Lund preferred a cedar material over pressure treated wood for its attractive appearance (even when weathered without staining), natural durability and absence of toxic chemicals. Pressure treated wood lacked these attributes.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman moved to approve the fence as shown in the photos using a spindle top or lattice top of the applicants' choice in cedar material. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-66: Request of William & Debra Patterson, 2260 South Overlook Road, to replace 2-car, detached garage.

Mr. Wong showed slides of the property. The proposal would demolish a garage that was 4' from the home and rebuild a garage in the same location. This received a variance from the Board of Zoning Appeals last week and was approved by City

Council last Monday. The slides showed two trees that were to be preserved and caused the need for a variance.

Ms. Fliegel asked about the home's roof pitch

Pride Remodeling's Paul Ziemski, 4254 Boston Road, Brunswick Hills, 44149, said the roof was a 9:12 pitch.

Ms. Fliegel said the ABR likes a garage's pitch to be similar to the home's roof pitch.

William Patterson, who had been sworn-in, said a steeper than 4:12 roof pitch would block views from the house's upper floor windows.

Mr. Lund observed that a back roof on a first floor section of the home had a less steep pitch than the 9:12 pitch of the main gable roof.

Mr. Wellman said it would be good for the roof to not be too high.

Ms. Fliegel asked about the garage's siding.

Mr. Patterson said the garage would be of cedar shake shingles painted to match the home's cedar shake shingles.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the garage as shown on the plans by Pride Remodeling, received June 1, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-067: Request of Keith & Terry Caryer, 2995 Edgehill Road, to replace 2-car, detached garage.

Mr. Wong showed slides of the site and explained that this garage also received a variance to allow it to be built in the same location as the previous garage. The 1' setback from the side and rear property lines needed to remain due to the home's proximity to the garage.

Apple Construction's Marc Apple, 2893 Euclid Heights Boulevard, 44118, who had been sworn-in, added that the garage would be of cement board lap siding and it was the intention of the owner to select a color for the garage siding and then repaint the home's lap siding to match. The 7" exposure of the home's lap siding would be matched on the garage as would the 1 by 4 casings.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the garage as shown on the plans by Apple Construction, received June 7, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-68: Request of Mona Miller, 912 Vineshire Road, to replace 2-car, detached garage.

Mr. Wong presented slides of the site, house and drawings. He explained that the tree seen in the aerial fell and crushed the old garage.

Orlando Builders' Fred Ward, 3634 Lindholm Road, Shaker Heights, 44120, who was sworn-in, said that a gray vinyl siding would match the home's color and siding shape.

ACTION: Mr. Lund moved to approve the garage as shown on the plans by Orlando Builders, received June 7, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-53 (continued case): Request of Aleksandr Stolyarov, 2890 Euclid Heights Boulevard, to convert attached garage into a bedroom and construct detached 4-car garage.

Ms. Fliegel said the latest revision that used stucco looking cement vertical siding deserved commendation. She was confident that the applicant would be happy with this material and its compatibility with the home.

Aleksandr Stolyarov, who had been sworn-in, asked if the ABR was insistent on use of the cement board siding. He contended that that siding would be ugly and hard to maintain.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman moved to approve the garage as shown on the plans by Robert Martien, received June 21, 2016. Seconded by Ms. Fliegel, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-69: Request of SB Realty Ohio, 1920 Revere Road, to replace 2-car, detached garage.

Mr. Wong showed slides of the site plan, house and drawings. He asked if the applicant knew the type of siding material on the front façade of the house.

Y K Brothers' Tim Akhadov, 3440 Sandy Hook Drive, Parma, 44134, who had been sworn-in, said he believed that the home was entirely of aluminum siding.

ACTION: Mr. Lund moved to approve the garage as shown on the plans by Y K Brothers, received June 21, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-71: Request of Michele Ross, 12433 Cedar Road, to install two fabric awnings each with lettering reading "Pavilion" (name of store).

Mr. Wong showed slides of the proposed awnings and historic slides showing this building's past awnings. He had realized just this week that the Heights Center Building was a designated local landmark. The case would be heard by the Landmark Commission on July 6th.

Pavilion's Leslie Marceau, 13002 Larchmere Boulevard, 44120, who had been sworn-in, said they were fortunate to have found this available space that will allow their business to grow. The awnings, which were less than a year old, would be relocated from the Larchmere storefront.

Mr. Lund said that awnings would be useful since the storefront's windows were south-facing.

Ms. Marceau acknowledged that their store would have furniture that the awnings would help to shield from the sun.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the proposed awnings as shown on the drawings and illustrations by Ohio Awning, received June 14, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-70: Request of Shimon Munk, 3732 Severn Road, to replace 2-car, detached garage. New garage to have attic and gambrel roof with ridge approximately 21' above grade.

Mr. Wong showed slides of the site, house and drawings.

Architect Eli Mahler, 3947 West Ash Lane, Cleveland, 44122, who had been sworn-in, said the garage's roof was a gambrel to afford height in an attic that would be for storage. Stairs would access the attic. He provided photos of a similar gambrel

roofed garage he had designed one block away on Shannon Road that had received ABR's approval.

Ms. Fliegel said the gambrel roof imparts a barn image that is unlike the home's style.

Mr. Wellman asked about the garage's height.

Mr. Mahler explained that the average height of the sloping roof was a code-conforming 15'.

Mr. Wong located a photo of the gambrel roofed garage on Shannon Road using Google Streetview.

Ms. Fliegel asked if the roof could be gabled so that it would be more compatible with the home.

Mr. Mahler said even a steeply pitched gable would lack the storage capacity of a gambrel roof.

Mr. Lund noticed that the attic floor was structured for a significant load. He added that the presence of the gambrel roofed garage nearby did not persuade him that a gambrel roof would be an appropriate architectural solution for this property.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman moved to continue the case for 90 days. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-72: Request of Ascent Construction, 998 Helmsdale Road, to replace 2-car, detached garage and construct dormer (note: no dormer was proposed).

Mr. Wong showed slides of the house and site.

Mr. Mahler said that the garage was to be white vinyl siding to match the home's white trim.

Mr. Lund commented on the oddly shaped lot.

Mr. Mahler said the new garage's location on the lot balanced access into the garage with preservation of usable lawn. He said that the second page was documentation of the garage's conformance to a new bracing requirement.

Mr. Wellman suggested that the garage approach and orientation be perpendicular to the house. The garage's left wall could either be 10' from the house or connected to it. That would afford room for a turnaround area.

Mr. Lund agreed with Mr. Wellman's suggestion that driveway circulation may be easier if a vehicle turnaround was provided.

ACTION: Mr. Lund moved to approve the garage as shown on the plans by Eli Mahler Architect, received June 13, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion unanimously passed.

Mr. Wellman reiterated his suggestion that the applicant consider a garage location that allows for a driveway turnaround but his alternative location was not required as a condition of approval.

ABR 2016-73: Request of Ascent Construction, 963 Selwyn Road, to replace 2-car, detached garage.

Mr. Mahler said this garage was the same design as the Helmsdale garage case.

Mr. Lund said the roof pitch matched the home's porch roof and the garage was squared up to the yard [meaning that no oddly shaped triangular spaces—such as those on the Helmsdale garage site plan-- would occur].

ACTION: Mr. Wellman moved to approve the garage as shown on the plans by Eli Mahler Architect, received June 13, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-74: Request of Ascent Construction, 862 Nelaview Road, to replace 2-car, detached garage.

Mr. Mahler showed the garage drawings and said it would be of white vinyl since the home had white trim.

Ms. Fliegel noted that although the roof pitch was only 4:12, the gables were on the sides not seen from the driveway.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the garage as shown on the plans by Eli Mahler, received June 13, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2016-75: Request of Metro PCS, 2225 Noble Road, to install new awning and 19 square-foot business identification sign.

Mr. Wong explained that the applicant was not present. No action was taken.

ABR 2016-76: Request of Robert & Donna Kirsch, 2858 Corydon Road, to replace existing sunroom and deck with screened porch and deck.

Mr. Wong reported that neither applicant nor architect would be able to attend an ABR meeting until the July 19th meeting.

OLD BUSINESS

No old business was brought before the ABR.

NEW BUSINESS

No new business was brought before the ABR.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 8:09 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Richard Bozic, Chair

date

Richard Wong, Secretary

date