

CITY OF CLEVELAND HEIGHTS
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES OF THE MEETING
April 5, 2016

MEMBERS PRESENT: Melissa Fliegel Acting Chair
 Erik Lund
 Michael Wellman

STAFF PRESENT: Elizabeth Rothenberg Assistant Law Director
 Richard Wong Planning Director

CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Wong called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. at which time all members were present.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MARCH 15, 2016 PUBLIC HEARING

Members suggested no corrections so the minutes were approved as submitted and signed by Ms. Fliegel.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MARCH 30, 2016 PUBLIC HEARING

Members suggested no corrections so these minutes were also approved as submitted and signed by Ms. Fliegel.

PUBLIC HEARING

APRIL 5, 2016

ABR 2016-032: Request of Pam Bertaud & Ray Gonzalez, 3014 Berkshire Rd., to replace casement windows using double-hung style per Chapter 1313.

Mr. Wong, who had been sworn-in, presented slides of the home and then showed the submitted illustrations.

Sam Steinacker of Window Universe Cleveland, 17409 Detroit Avenue, Lakewood, and owners Pam Bertaud and Ray Gonzalez, all of whom had been sworn-in, presented their proposal.

Mr. Wellman said it was unusual for historically appropriate, double-hung windows to replace more modern looking casement windows. The opposite was more usual.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman moved to approve the proposed windows as shown on the plans by Window Universe Cleveland, received March 2, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-033: Request of Deb and Gary Franke, 2573 Guilford Road, to build 1-story, 11' x 21' addition on rear of home per Chapter 1313.

Mr. Wong presented slides of the context and drawings.

Designer Donald Tarantino, 1802 Radnor Road, and landscape designer Charlene Crowley, 17100 Van Aken Boulevard, Shaker Heights, who both had been sworn-in, presented the proposal. Mr. Tarantino said a neighbor's concerns regarding privacy and the loss of trees were addressed by the proposal. The trees that were cut down were problematic and the landscaping was being redesigned using Ms. Crowley's plan.

Ms. Fliegel said she read Mr. Katt's letter but reasoned that a privacy fence requirement would be outside of the ABR's review.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the proposed screened-in porch as shown on the plans by Donald Tarantino, received March 3, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-034: Request of Boost Mobile, 2579 Noble Road, to install 11'-6" x 1'-5" internally lit, wall-mounted sign per Code Section 1163.08 and Chapters 1313 and 1323.

Carl Rappaport, representing Sign-Lite, 12655 Coit Road, Cleveland, 44108, who had been sworn-in, described the Boost Mobile sign proposal.

ACTION: Mr. Lund moved to approve the sign as shown on the drawing by Sign-Lite, received March 9, 2016, with the condition that dimensions including those indicated on the marked up drawing be submitted on a shop drawing for ABR administrative approval prior to receiving a permit. Seconded by Ms. Fliegel, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-035: Request of Greta De Meyer and Walter Lambrecht, 2660 Derbyshire Road, to replace east side, double-hung window using window of different style per Chapter 1313.

Mr. Wong presented slides of the context and the applicant's photos and photo simulation.

Owners Greta De Meyer and Walter Lambrecht and contractor Chris Margevicius, 4179 W. 59th Street, 44144, all of whom had been sworn-in, further described the proposal. Mr. Lambrecht said that they wanted the bathroom window's width to align with the kitchen window below.

Mr. Wellman said the new window improved the home's appearance and looked better than the original window.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman moved to approve the window as shown on the applicant's photo simulation, received March 10, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-036: Request of Michael & Sharlene Warner, 2592 Princeton Road, to construct two-car garage per Chapter 1313.

Mr. Wong presented slides of the property and plans.

John D'Amico of the Great Garage Company, 8550 Wallings Road, North Royalton, 44133, who had been sworn-in, said that the new garage would be a couple feet deeper but aligned with the existing concrete driveway. A Board of Zoning Appeals variance was needed to rebuild the garage 18 inches from the property line instead of three feet. He wanted to avoid modifying the existing driveway because an 18" wide strip of new concrete would be problematic next to the old driveway.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the garage as shown on the plans by the Great Garage Company, received March 15, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-037: Request of Vince Reddy, 908 Vineshire Road, to construct 1-car garage per Chapter 1313.

Mr. Wong presented slides of the property and plans.

Vince Reddy, who had been sworn-in, said the garage was demolished when a massive oak tree fell on it. His lot was 40' wide and City Council and the Board of Zoning Appeals had approved a one-car garage so that he would continue to have a usable back yard.

ACTION: Mr. Lund moved to approve the garage as shown on the plans, received March 25, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-038: Request of 2878 Hampshire LLC, 2878 Hampshire Road, for alterations including two-story rear addition per Chapter 1313.

Architect Eli Mahler, 3947 West Ash Lane, 44122, and the owner's representative, Zoltan Dezso, 3419 Lawton Lane, Pepper Pike, 44124, both of whom had been sworn-in, described the addition. Mr. Mahler said that the foundation was to be similar to the home's existing foundation [a rock-faced, block-in-course ashlar]. He said Mr. Wong had discussed alternatives to vinyl siding but almost 90% of the homes in the neighborhood had vinyl siding, so this home would be sided in vinyl.

Mr. Wellman noted that the front elevation's existing window muntin pattern and the door styles were not provided.

ACTION: Mr. Fliegel moved to approve the plans by architect Eli Mahler, received April 4, 2016, with the condition that the front elevation drawing show specific window and door styles and that the information be presented for an ABR administrative approval. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-039: Request of The Centers for Families and Children, 1941 South Taylor Road, to install glass and aluminum door and transom window on south wall per Chapter 1313.

Architect Paul Beegan, 15703 Madison Avenue, Lakewood, 44107, and Matt Sattler, representative of the Centers for Families and Children, 4500 Euclid Avenue, Cleveland, 44103, had both been sworn-in. Mr. Beegan explained that an egress door was needed for direct exiting from a new infant day care room.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the plan by Beegan Architectural Design, received April 5, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-040: Request of Rebecca & Don Kimble, 2540 Fairmount Boulevard, to construct site improvements including a fountain, stone walls and piers and gate per Chapter 1313.

Alan Carley, Impulliti Landscaping designer, 14659 Ravenna Road, Burton, 44021, who had been sworn-in, described the site work. Stone piers and gates were defined by the Zoning Code as fences which required approval by the ABR and needed a Board of Zoning Appeals' variance.

Mr. Lund wanted the applicant to know that fence height was typically required to be low since most fences were built on a property's boundary, next to the sidewalk. This type of height restriction prevents a public street from being too walled-in. The proposed piers, low walls and gates were set far back into the property such that the height was not at all an issue.

Hugh Fisher, 2514 Fairmount Boulevard, who had been sworn-in, said the proposed design completed the design of the house.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman moved to approve the plans by Alan Carley, received March 21, 2016. Seconded by Ms. Fliegel, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-041: Request of Ken & Kathy Torgerson, 3040 Fairmount Boulevard, to construct 1-story, 16' x 20' addition onto back of home per Chapter 1313.

Architect Mike Caito, 2603 Fenwick Avenue, University Heights, 44118, who had been sworn-in, started his presentation by showing the previous version that had been preliminarily reviewed by ABR at the December 15, 2015 meeting. He said ABR had originally commented that the addition needed to increase its visual compatibility with the scale of the existing home. The new design was taller, addressing that comment. A second suggestion to change the roof from asphalt shingle to copper was too expensive.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the addition as shown on the plans by Mike Caito, received March 21, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-042: Request of Mark & Melanie Biche, 2515 Fairmount Boulevard, to construct two-story home per Chapter 1313.

Mr. Wong showed slides of the context. When slides of the proposed house were shown, architect Mike Caito described the design.

Mr. Caito said the new house's driveway would connect to Nottingham Lane, avoiding a driveway onto Fairmount. The front of the home would still face Fairmount. The home's look would be younger feeling than the Biche's current historic home

nearby. A first floor master bedroom and other rooms were clustered around a courtyard.

Neighbor Rob Gudbranson, 2521 Fairmount Boulevard, who had been sworn-in, asked about the circles that looked like trees on the site plan.

Jason Baylor of Payne & Payne Builders, the contractor, 10750 Mayfield Road, Chardon, 44024, who had been sworn-in, said those were six-inch caliper or larger trees that had been identified in the survey.

Mr. Caito said the intent was to preserve trees on as much of the wooded site as possible. Regarding the home's setback, the front would align with the front of neighboring homes. The materials would be stone, fiber cement siding and a lot of glass.

Mr. Wellman liked the Mid-century Modern design, saying that the design was proceeding in the right direction.

Ms. Fliegel said she might feel differently about the design if so many trees had not been in the front yard.

Mr. Lund asked if the carport could be relocated farther from the 42" caliper tree.

Mr. Wong mentioned tree preservation resources and said that the client should decide if he wanted to save that tree. The carport would not be so close to the tree if it was important to the client to save that tree.

Hugh Fisher, 2514 Fairmount Boulevard, who had been sworn-in, said he really liked the design and that the illustrations helped. The surrounding historic houses were of brick, stucco and cut stone and he would like to see this home's materials visually tie into-- and acknowledge-- the historic homes. He added that a rustic look works if the site stays heavily wooded but if the house was more exposed to the street, colors and materials should then be more consistent with the historic homes' materials.

ACTION: No action was taken since the applicants had only requested a Preliminary Review.

ABR 2016-043: Request of The Hebrew Academy of Cleveland, 1516 Warrensville Center Rd., to enclose south exterior stair per Chapter 1313.

Architect Ronald Kluchin, 23215 Commerce Park, 44122, who had been sworn-in, presented his proposal for a stair enclosure at the Hebrew Academy high school at

the building that had been the Oakwood Club's clubhouse. Students were presently at a building near Notre Dame College in South Euclid. Mr. Kluchin said the exterior stair would be of stone that matched the newer dining room's stone. The stair's windows would match the look of the dining room's windows. He explained that a large rooftop mechanical unit would be concealed by this proposal.

ACTION: Mr. Lund moved to approve the design proposed on the plans by Architect Ron Kluchin, received March 21, 2015. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion unanimously passed.

OLD BUSINESS

Nothing was reported.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 8:59 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Richard Bozic, Chair

date

Richard Wong, Secretary

date