

**CITY OF CLEVELAND HEIGHTS
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES OF THE MEETING
FEBRUARY 6, 2018**

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Melissa Fliegel, Chair
Erik Lund
Jonathan Kurtz

STAFF PRESENT:

Richard Wong, Planning Director

CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Wong called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM at which time two members were present including alternate member Jonathan Kurtz, filling in for Michael Wellman, whose absence was excused.

APPROVAL OF THE JANUARY 18, 2018 MINUTES

Members had no comments or questions so the minutes were approved as submitted and were signed by Ms. Fliegel who arrived just before conclusion of this action item.

SPECIAL JOINT MEETING WITH LANDMARK COMMISSION

Mr. Wong explained that the meeting's agenda was altered to accommodate the schedule of the Landmark Commission who would jointly review the College Club's house renovation and alterations. The new construction was not to be reviewed by them. Planning staff member Kara O'Donnell called the roll of the Landmark Commission.

LANDMARK COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mazie Adams, Chair
Jim Edmonson
Ken Goldberg
Margaret Lann
Thomas Veider

**PUBLIC HEARING
FEBRUARY 6, 2018**

ABR 2018-263: WXZ Residential Group/CC, LLC, 2350 Overlook Road, request to adaptively reuse for 10 apartments the home that had been College Club's location, remove newer 1-story addition, renovate historic carriage house for 4 apartments and construct on the existing parking lot three buildings containing 13 two-and-three story townhomes including site improvements.

- WXZ's James Wymer and Dave Swindell, 22720 Fairview Center Drive, #150, 44126, and Dimit Architect's Paul Glowacki, 14414 Detroit Road, #306, 44107, described the renovation. Mr. Wymer said that the plan was to use historic tax credits to renovate the one-hundred-plus-year-old home and carriage home into fourteen market-rate rental units. Thirteen for-sale attached townhomes would be constructed on the same property.
- Paul Glowacki described the context with photos. An addition would be demolished and a patio constructed in its place. The exterior of the house and carriage house would be cleaned and restored with techniques approved by Ohio Historic Preservation Office. Seventeen parking spaces will be in back. The lawn in front would remain. A window of one of the apartments will become a door to a deck. Mechanical units will be on the flat roofed part of the house, not easily seen from the ground. Third floor skylights are proposed and have been approved by OHPO. In response to a question from Ms. Lann, Mr. Glowacki said an historic consultant, Heather Rudge, provided much direction and information for the project team. Modifications to the interior walls and doors were minimized for historic preservation reasons. The mechanicals will be concealed in dropped ceilings in bathrooms and hallways.

ACTION: Ms. Lann moved to approve alterations to this property as shown on the plans by Dimit Architects, received January 18, 2018. Seconded by Ms. Adams, the motion was unanimously approved by the Landmark Commission. Note: At this time, the regular ABR agenda resumed. The new construction at the College Club would be reviewed last.

ABR 2018-256: Fitness Zone, 3554 Mayfield Road, requests to install Fitness Zone sign replacement for World Gym sign.

- Brilliant Electric Sign's Major Harrison, 4811 Van Epps Road, 44131, said the sign's materials would match the previous sign's.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the sign as shown on the plan by Brilliant Electric Sign, received January 18, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2018-257: Tim McDonough, 3392 Dellwood Road, requests to blacken glass of three first floor windows on side of home, install sliding door, remove two sets of casement windows and replace kitchen door with window.

- Tim McDonough said a relocated kitchen required blacking out three windows. He had planned to remove the three windows but found that his home's vinyl siding was not available, so the patch would not have matched. An 8' sliding door and other alterations were proposed on the back wall. In response to a comment from Mr. Lund, he said grids could be on the sliding doors.
- Mr. Lund suggested that the grids match the proportions of window mullions of the house.

- Ms. Fliegel said approval should be only for the sliding door and blacked out windows, not for removal of the back door under the porch roof. Natural light to the breakfast area will be reduced.
- Mr. McDonough said he would drop the idea of removing the back porch door and leaving a blank wall. As shown in one of his renderings, a window will be installed where the door was.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the three blacked-out windows, 8' sliding door, and window replacing a back porch door as shown on the plans by architect Lee Pozek, received January 12, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2018-258: Kathy and Rich Fox, 3402 Clarendon Road, request to change windows using double-hung style that doesn't match windows being replaced.

- Rich Fox said the seven new windows would replace ones that did not look like the home's historic windows.

ACTION: Mr. Lund moved to approve the proposed windows as shown on the drawings by Window Nation, received January 17, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Kurtz, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2018-259: Peter and Heidi Robertson, 1965 Mornington Lane, #8, request to install bay window and skylights.

- TPA Builders' John Payne, 4310 St. Clair Avenue, 44103, said other Mornington Lane units have received approval of a similar design.
- Mr. Lund requested that the roof line be raised to align with other first floor roofs and the apron of the bay window be taller.
- Mr. Payne said the top of the window is set by a lintel but the apron could be taller.

ACTION: Mr. Lund moved to approve the window and skylights as shown on the plans by TPA Builders with the condition that the apron directly below the window be taller. Seconded by Mr. Kurtz, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2018-260: Prospective purchaser Jeffrey Bradish, 1970 Lee Road, requests to install three sets of doors on west side and awning and signs for Paws dog day-care and kennel.

- Jeffrey Bradish and Justified Design Collaborative's architect Joshua Cunningham, 33845 Chagrin Boulevard, 44022, said part of this vacant Rite Aid will be reused as a dog day care and boarding facility. The proposed fence will be an 8'-high white vinyl fence as shown in the sample photos. Signs are proposed on the north, east and south sides of the building. Mr. Bradish said he preferred a blue background filling the margins to the brick rather than leaving strips of tan on the edges.
- Mr. Wong said the background color can be excluded from the sign's area calculation.

- Mr. Kurtz wanted the south sign abutting the brick rather than leaving a tan strip to the right of the sign.
- Mr. Bradish said three pairs of double doors would be added to the west side. The fence would hide the doors from view by the public. In response to Ms. Fliegel's question, he said the awning was an option under consideration.
- Ms. Fliegel said the awning should be as wide as the sign's blue background (spanning from one brick pilaster to the next brick pilaster).
- Mr. Lund said the awning's height should be at the same as the front awnings.
- Mr. Kurtz suggested that the fence be protected from vehicles by bollards or other similar objects. He also said the awning could be fabric.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the signs, awning, fence and doors as shown on the plans by Justified Design Collaborative, received February 6, 2018 with the conditions that the signs' background extend to the brick as on the marked-up plan and that the awning be as wide as the brick pilasters and be as tall as the awnings on the front. Revised drawings are to be submitted for an ABR administrative approval. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2018-261: Cleveland Heights/University Heights Board of Education, 14780 Superior Road, requests to move unapproved, prefabricated 10' x 20' shed from west side to south side of main building.

- The School Board's Tige Dague, said the shed contains lawn care equipment and snowblowers.
- Mr. Wong said that the shed needed to be moved from the west to the south side to be code conforming.
- Ms. Fliegel said moving it helped the property's aesthetics. When the shed needed to be repainted, it would look better one color than two.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the shed moved to the south side of the building as shown on the plans by McKnight & Associates, received January 18, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2018-262: Huntington Bank, 1865 Coventry Road, requests to replace front entry system.

- Architect Gerald Weber, 13711 Madison Avenue, 44107 and Huntington Bank's Don Sculrek, 40 Front Street, 44017, said the replacement front entry was needed for tighter security. The one-door entry will be replaced by this aluminum finished two-door design. In response to a comment by Mr. Lund, he said the finish would not be an anodized bronze color like the windows. It would be silver and would match the ATM's stainless steel finish. A special order for the dark bronze anodized finish would delay the doors' arrival. The

photo showed that the front lacked brightness and the silver would lighten it up.

- Mr. Lund said the windows were all dark bronze and did not like the look of a silver door.
- Ms. Fliegel said this building's look was iconic and the silver door would be regrettable.
- Mr. Weber said in response to Ms. Fliegel's question that the order for silver doors has already been placed.

ACTION: Members agreed to continue the matter so that the applicant could check on ordering a dark bronze anodized version. An ABR administrative approval would be possible for the dark bronze anodized finished door system at the next meeting.

ABR 2018-263: WXZ Residential Group/CC, LLC, 2350 Overlook Road, request to adaptively reuse for 10 apartments the home that had been College Club's location, remove newer 1-story addition, renovate historic carriage house for 4 apartments and construct on the existing parking lot three buildings containing 13 two-and-three story townhomes including site improvements. (Note: Landmark Commission had already departed, having approved the alterations to the historic home and carriage house at this time.)

- Dimit Architects' Paul Glowacki said the historic home was the heart of the project. It will still have a large green space in front. A lot of different configurations were looked at for the new buildings. Neighboring single-family homes surround the sites in modern and traditional styles. Beautiful views from the site were taken advantage of. Three clusters of eight, three and two buildings are proposed. A walkway between rows of townhomes connects to another mews fronted by porches. The double gable of the historic home becomes a shape used on the front eight townhomes. Brick is proposed as the primary material. The window bays and chimneys will be a cement panel product that is like a stone veneer. Clad wood windows are proposed. Interior views of first-floor master bedrooms, two-car garages and open floor plans were shown. Roof decks would have outdoor kitchen options. The shorter, two-story townhomes are on the ends, closer to the adjacent homes. The middle three townhomes have a more modern motif that will be gem-like. A perspective from a Derbyshire Road home's backyard was shown in response to his request.
- Mr. Lund said the new buildings' were rendered in dark materials, questioning if they needed to be as dark as shown. He also urged for more detailed refinement for a consistently high level of artistry and craftsmanship, citing brick details on the historic home and carriage house.
- Mr. Kurtz said the material sample boards depicted the new buildings' materials better than the renderings. The massing of the buildings was good,

but as a minor point, he found the openings in the double-gabled feature too big. The gable didn't look as stout as it should.

- Mr. Swindell said the two openings were still being studied, agreeing that they were slightly too big.
- Ms. Fliegel said overall, she really liked this project and it was very well-done. She questioned the modern forms' proximity to the traditional forms.
- Mr. Swindell cited the two modern-styled homes on Derbyshire whose backyards faced this property. The modern sections of this design add a reference to those homes and provide contrast and interest.
- Mr. Kurtz questioned the proportion of the two slit windows of the projecting third floor form on the end unit facing the seating area. He also asked about the material to be used for the gray panels. He didn't want the building to have expensive materials contrasted with materials having a cheap look.
- Mr. Glowacki said those were to be "Fiber C" panels which were a rainscreen with concealed fasteners. Hardi materials would have had a cheap look but the proposed panel system is engineered to look right.
- 9th Avenue Designs' landscape architect Pat Beam, 1588 Sheridan Road, 44121, said that plantings included evergreens, shade trees, flowering trees, perennials and grasses for year-round color.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the adaptive reuse of the house and carriage house and the construction of the 13 townhomes as shown on the plans by Dimit Architects, received January 18, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion was unanimously approved.

Old Business

ABR 2018-249: GMC Cleveland, LLC, 2900-2916 Mayfield Road (continued from January 18, 2018), requests to install: a) Freedom Motors 6' x 6' electronic message center sign replacing Rainforest Car Wash internally lit sign; b) low wall with six flags on poles approximately 20'-high; c) 6'-6" wide by 7'-10" high Rainforest Car Wash electronic message center sign.

- Cornachione & Wallace's architect, Todd Wallace, 505 West Park Avenue, 44203, said that the Rain Forest Car Wash sign cabinet would still be reused for Freedom Motors' electronic message center. In this revision, the cabinet would have a stone-look material surrounding it. The material would be similar to Motorcars Honda's wall. Rainforest Car Wash's and Motorcars Toyota's signs would have an electronic message center smaller and lower than the original proposal. These would also have a stone-look surrounding them.
- Mr. Lund said he appreciated the revisions.
- Ms. Fliegel still had a concern about the closeness of the electronic message center signs. The images on the sign changed every few seconds. A proliferation of these signs would be started.

- Motorcars Toyota's Matt Gile, 2950 Mayfield Road, 44118, agreed that the images needed to change less frequently. His Daylight Donuts' sign was malfunctioning and changing so frequently it couldn't be read.
- Mr. Lund said a row of these signs would be distracting to drivers and would create an impression of the City. If the City required these signs to hold the image for a minute, the proposal would be much improved from the quickly changing look.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve Freedom Motors' electronic message center and Rainforest Car Wash's electronic message center, low wall and flags as shown on the plans by Cornachione & Wallace, received February 6, 2018, with the condition that the Freedom Motors' sign be in the existing original metal cabinet with no additional stone-look surrounding it. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion was unanimously approved.

ABR 2018-251: Seidman Family LTD Partnership, 2950 Mayfield Road (continued from January 18, 2018), requests to relocate freestanding 8'-wide by 6'-high used car sign and to install a low wall with six flags on poles approximately 20'-high and a 6'-6" wide by 7'-10" high Motorcars Toyota electronic message center sign.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve Motorcars Toyota's electronic message center sign, low wall and flags as shown on the plans by Cornachione & Wallace, received February 6, 2018. Seconded by Mr. Lund, the motion was unanimously approved.

Old Business

No old business was raised.

New Business

No new business was raised.

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 9:45 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,

Michael Wellman, Vice Chair

date

Richard Wong, Secretary

date