

CITY OF CLEVELAND HEIGHTS
ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW
MINUTES OF THE MEETING
MAY 17, 2016

MEMBERS PRESENT: Richard Bozic Chair
Melissa Fliegel
Michael Wellman

STAFF PRESENT: Elizabeth Rothenberg Assistant Law Director
Richard Wong Planning Director

CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Wong called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. at which time all members were present.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MAY 3, 2016 PUBLIC HEARING

Members suggested no corrections so the minutes were approved as submitted and signed by Mr. Bozic.

**PUBLIC HEARING
MAY 17, 2016**

ABR 2016-052: Request of Vikki Patacca, 2604 Dartmoor Road, to build detached 2-car garage.

Mr. Wong, who had been sworn-in, presented slides of the property furnished by the applicant.

New Creation Builders' Diane Bija, 5309 Barkwill Avenue, 44127, who had been sworn-in, explained the project as the slides were shown. The existing garage was demolished. The existing garage had a flat roof but the new roof would have a standard 4:12 pitch. The new garage would be in the same location as the previous one. White trim on the garage will match the home's and the siding will match the home's wood siding in appearance but will be vinyl in a 4" lapped style.

Mr. Bozic asked about the elevations' lack of trim around the doors.

Ms. Bija said the doors will have trim that matches the home's.

Mr. Bozic asked if the garage roof pitch could be increased to match the steeper pitch of the gable roof over the home's entry.

Ms. Bija said the pitch will be increased and definitely match the home's front entrance's gable roof. She said it would increase the cost but that she would work with the homeowner on price and make it happen.

ACTION: Mr. Bozic moved to approve the garage as shown on the plans by New Creation Builders, received May 4, 2016 subject to the conditions that the roof pitch match the home's front entry's roof pitch and that the detailing, including vinyl siding and trim, match the home's in shape and color. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-054: Request of Kathy Sharkoff, 3535 Meadowbrook Boulevard, to replace windows but not match existing windows' appearance.

Morning Star Windows & Doors' Dwayne Wimer, 52 Overlook Place, 44146, who had been sworn-in, pointed out the windows proposed for replacement. He explained that the owner plans in the future to replace the remaining older windows as budget permits.

Mr. Wellman said the new windows were an improvement.

ACTION: Mr. Wellman moved to approve the windows as shown on the illustrations by Morning Star Windows & Doors, received May 7, 2016. Seconded by Ms. Fliegel, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-053: Request of Aleksandr Stolyarov, 2890 Euclid Heights Boulevard, to convert attached garage into a bedroom and construct detached 4-car garage.

Mr. Wong, who had been sworn-in, presented slides of the property and neighboring properties and then showed the drawings furnished by the applicant. A city staff illustration pointed out the proximity of two tall shade trees whose roots would be affected by the garage construction. He said that the applicant was willing to afford special attention to avoid harming the trees. His suggestion was to locate the garage eighteen instead of ten feet from the west property line and to locate the new driveway twenty feet from the west property line. If the applicant wanted to check for roots before deciding on the placement, the garage excavation should begin at the farthest east part of original location of the garage. If thick

roots were excavated, over 4" thick, the garage should be relocated to avoid removal of those thick roots.

Platinum Construction's Tim Akadov, 5081 Warrensville Center Road, 44137, who had been sworn-in, said he agreed with staff's suggestion about protecting the two trees. He said that the area next to the drive would be paved with size #57 gravel for visitor parking.

Mr. Wong said that gravel paving would need to be set into a cell-like plastic product. The gravel goes into grids that resemble an ice cube tray and hold the gravel in place. The elevations and cross section were then shown and Mr. Wong noted that no height dimensions were provided.

Mr. Akadov said the dimension from grade to the soffit would be ten feet.

Ms. Fliegel noted the home's distinctive style and finishes.

Mr. Bozic asked about providing stucco walls to match the home's.

Mr. Akadov said stucco was too costly for a garage that would be freestanding and in the back yard.

Mr. Bozic said the house possessed a lot of architectural character and the proposed garage looked like a standard garage.

Mr. Akadov said the garage's roof, siding and door color could match the home's colors.

Mr. Bozic said the house has a lot of detail around the roof and that the garage would be seen from the street.

Mr. Akadov said the garage would most likely be in the location farther from the west property line, not visible from the street.

Mr. Bozic said nothing visually ties the garage's design to the house's design. He cited the first garage case, approved with a condition that the garage's roof pitch match the home's roof pitch.

Mr. Akadov said the garage could match the home's roof pitch which looked to be 6:12.

Mr. Wellman said other changes could be made such as tapering the roof at the eave like the home's roof [a false thatched roof was on the home].

Mr. Akadov said the home's asphalt shingles were not designed to be used for that application and they did not look right.

Mr. Wellman said the roof didn't look bad. He said the home had many elements such as the roof brackets that could be incorporated into the garage design and even if stucco walls were not on the garage, the design could be provided more character.

Mr. Bozic said the home's garage conversion showed infill of the garage doors using stucco.

Mr. Akadov said the garage walls were to be of 2 by 4s and OSB [oriented strand board] that would not support stucco.

Mr. Wellman said imitation board such as Hardie boards should be considered.

Mr. Bozic summarized the ABR's sentiment saying that ABR would have difficulty approving the vinyl sided garage as it was currently proposed.

Mr. Akadov asked if stucco could be used only on the front garage wall.

Ms. Fliegel said that changing the material from the front to the other three sides of vinyl siding would need to be studied. She suggested looking at use of a Hardie board panel.

Mr. Wellman asked that the designer of the house's garage conversion be consulted.

Mr. Bozic clarified that ABR was not requiring stucco but did need the garage design to be tied to the character of the house.

Ms. Fliegel suggested consideration of a three-car garage if budget did not permit a four-car garage.

R.C. Westwood Company's Ron Cotes, 3917 Buckingham Drive, 44212, who had been sworn-in, said he was a contractor and suggested a 7:12 or 8:12 roof pitch, a cream colored vinyl siding that matched the home's stucco color and some garage doors that had a cottage style. He said those three items would have an incredible impact but minimal increase to the budget.

Mr. Akadov asked if the project could be approved with notes.

Ms. Fliegel said the garage design would require too many changes for it to be approved as noted.

ACTION: It was unanimous that this should be considered a preliminary review and that the garage design be revised before coming back.

ABR 2016-055: Request of James Cartellone, 3351 Washington Boulevard, to construct rear patio and 2-car detached garage.

Mr. Wong showed slides of the property.

R. C. Westwood Company's Ron Cotes, 3917 Buckingham Drive, 44212, who had been sworn-in, said the garage would be constructed at the same location as the previous garage. Its vinyl siding would match vinyl siding that is to replace aluminum siding on the home's front façade's second floor.

Mr. Bozic said the garage roof's pitch looked steep enough on the plans.

Mr. Cotes said the pitch was to be 4:12.

Ms. Fliegel said the drawing labeled the pitch as 6:12.

It was agreed that the garage pitch would match the home roof's pitch.

ACTION: Mr. Bozic moved to approve the garage as shown on the plans by the R. C. Westwood Company, received May 9, 2016, with the condition that the garage's roof pitch match the home's roof pitch. Seconded by Ms. Fliegel, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-056: Request of Cuyahoga Land Bank, 3015 Washington Boulevard, to construct 2-car detached garage.

The Cuyahoga Land Bank's Brian Price, 323 West Lakeside Avenue, 44113, who had been sworn-in, described the garage design.

Mr. Wong explained that the framing had begun as evident in the photos but construction stopped once he found out that a permit was needed.

Members appreciated the concern for details evident in this garage design.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the plans by the Cuyahoga Land Bank, received April 29, 2016 and May 17, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-057: Request of Mr. & Mrs. William Schwab, 3598 Berkeley Road, to construct 1-story rear kitchen and bedroom addition.

Architect Eli Mahler, 3947 West Ash Lane, 44122, who had been sworn-in, presented the proposal. He said the house was brick but the addition would use real wood siding painted to match the back of the home. A gable roof was also proposed over the front door.

ACTION: Ms. Fliegel moved to approve the addition and front entry roof as shown on the plans by architect Eli Mahler, received May 3, 2016 and May 17, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Bozic, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-059: Request of Warren Gissentaner, 3324 Hyde Park Avenue, to construct 2-story family room, kitchen and master bedroom-bath addition.

Owner and Total Structural Services' contractor, Warren Gissentaner, 3324 Hyde Park Avenue, who had been sworn-in, presented the project. He wanted to create a larger kitchen, master bath and family room. He already removed the aluminum siding and refinished the existing home's wood siding. The addition would be clad in wood siding to match the existing home's. Existing windows will be reused on the back of the house and new windows will be of wood to match.

Ms. Fliegel commented about the addition's roof being visible from the street above the existing home's ridge. After a thorough discussion between members and the applicant, it was decided that the design was fine as drawn.

ACTION: Mr. Bozic moved to approve the plans by draftsman Lynell Pointer, received May 12, 2016. Seconded by Mr. Wellman, the motion unanimously passed.

ABR 2016-060: Request of Superstarz Elite Boutique, 2909 Mayfield Road, to install business identification sign.

Fast Sign's Paul Gallagher, 5369 Mayfield Road, 44124, and boutique owner Tawana Starr Spratt, 5119 Oakmont Drive, 44124, who were both sworn-in, described the sign proposal. Mr. Gallagher showed three versions of the sign, two of which exceeded the maximum sign area permitted by the Zoning Code.

Ms. Spratt showed pictures of the store's interior to explain the importance of pink in the branding of her boutique. She had been under the impression that the original four lines of text were not going to be allowed by the City.

Mr. Wong explained that the City was not prohibiting four lines of text but the original proposed sign's size was too large to be permitted. Reduced in size to a code conforming size, the four lines of lettering would be hard to read.

Mr. Bozic suggested window signs to reduce the amount of information on the sign.

Mr. Wong showed a Google's Streetview of the building including neighboring tenants' signs.

Mr. Bozic said the approved sign would set a standard for future signs of the other tenants whose signs were now just on storefront windows. He suggested considering the addition of purple to the sign since the stoop was purple.

Members continued to offer suggestions but concluded that additional design work was needed.

ACTION: Members determined that the applicant needed to present alternatives at a future meeting.

OLD BUSINESS

No old business was raised.

NEW BUSINESS

No new business was raised.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 8:28 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Richard Bozic

Richard Bozic, Chair

25 MAY 16

date

Richard Wong

Richard Wong, Secretary

May 25, 2016

date